



Agenda Item #: 4A
Meeting Date: May 25, 2021
Prepared By: Linda Ruffing, Planning Consultant
Reviewed By: _____
Luke Sims
Interim Comm. Development Director

REQUEST FOR PLANNING COMMISSION ACTION

PROJECT TITLE: North Village Mixed-Use Project

SUBJECT: Major Design Review (DR 2021-07)
Major Conditional Use Permit (CUP 2021-04)

The proposed project consists of 45 multi-family apartments, five live-work units, and approximately 12,530 square feet of retail space in three residential scale buildings on a 5.10-acre parcel.

The proposed uses were approved by a Master Conditional Use Permit (CUP 2019-04) approved by the Planning Commission on February 11, 2020. A Major Design Review Permit and a Major Conditional Use Permit are required to authorize the proposed project design and operating characteristics.

PROPERTY ADDRESS: 16977 Healdsburg Avenue, Healdsburg, CA

Note: Site addresses have not yet been assigned to the parcels in the North Village development

ASSESSOR PARCEL NO.: APN 091-060-039; 091-060-025

GEN'L PLAN & ZONING: Mixed Use (MU)/ North Entry Area Plan Overlay (NEAP)

APPLICANT/OWNER: Comstock Healdsburg, LLC

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

By motion, it is recommended that the Planning Commission approve Resolution No. 2021-08 (Exhibit 1) approving Major Design Review Permit DR 2021-07 and Major Conditional Use Permit CUP 2021-04 for development of the North Village Mixed Use project, based on the suggested findings and subject to the recommended conditions of approval.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION:

The applicant and property owner, Comstock Healdsburg, LLC, requests a Major Design Review approval (DR 2021-07) and a Major Conditional Use Permit (CUP 2021-04) to authorize development

of a mixed use (residential and commercial) project on a 5.1-acre parcel located on the west side of Healdsburg Avenue near the northern Healdsburg city limit (Exhibit 2). The applicant's narrative project description is provided in Exhibit 3.

Exhibit M1 presents the Plan Set for both the Mixed Use and Hotel components of the North Village project. The Mixed Use component consists of a cluster of three separate residential-scale buildings which provide approximately 12,530 square feet of retail space and five live-work units at street level and 45 residential units on the second and third stories (Exhibit M1, Sheet A-1.6). The residences are comprised of a mix of studio, one- and two-bedroom units. Two of the buildings are situated along Boxheart Drive. Neighborhood serving retail stores and cafes are envisioned at street level with pockets of outdoor areas for street-side dining and merchandise display. Some of the retail stores will have secondary storefronts engaging with the pedestrian promenade which is located to the east. A separate three-story building further to the east helps frame the promenade/courtyard area. The three-story massing steps down to two-story massing to the east. The ground floor of this building houses the five live-work units. The residential units on the upper stories are linked with exterior covered corridors and all have private balconies. The gross square footage of the residential uses is 59,139 square feet. Of this, 43,758 square feet is conditioned space and 15,381 square feet is covered, unconditioned space. Exhibit M1, Sheets AH1-2.1 through AH3-3.1 show the floor plans, roof plans and elevations for the three mixed-use buildings. The exterior finishes are natural stone on the ground level with wood siding/composite wood siding on the upper levels and a standing seam metal roof. The entryways and recessed balconies are finished with an accent wood siding. Exhibit M1, Sheets A-1.13 and A-1.14 show a rendering of the Mixed Use project frontage on Boxheart Drive (both with and without trees).

Exhibit M1, Sheet L-1.26 shows an enlargement of the promenade which is situated between the retail spaces and the live-work units. The entry to the promenade from Boxheart Drive is aligned with an elevated, colored/stamped concrete crosswalk. An arbor with flowering vines frames the entryway. Sheet L-1.26 identifies the furnishing and landscaping for the promenade and the crossing of Dovetail Lane to the "Grange" building on the hotel parcel. Sheets A-1.16.1 and A-1.16.2 show a rendering of the Promenade as viewed from the Dovetail Lane entry (both with and without trees).

A total of 64 onsite parking spaces are dedicated to the Mixed Use Project residential uses in a parking lot located between the development and the NCRA corridor (Exhibit M1, Sheet A-1.24). A total of 72 shared parking spaces are proposed for the retail uses, including 17 spaces at the south end of the parking lot, 21 spaces at the Dovetail Lane entry to the parking lot, and 35 on-street parking space on Boxheart Drive and Dovetail Lane. Exhibit M1, Sheet L-1.14 shows the landscape plan for the parking lot.

A number of modifications to the Plan Set (Exhibit M1) were made in response to feedback provided at the April 13, 2021 Planning Commission workshop. The sheets that have been revised are noted with asterisks on the Index (Exhibit M1, Sheet G-0.2) and include the following:

- Sheets A-1.13 and A-1.14 "View from Main Street looking north" - revised renderings (shown with and without trees) to include an arbor with flowering vines framing the entry to the promenade between the two mixed-use buildings on the Boxheart Drive frontage.
- Sheets A-1.16.1 and A-1.16 "View from Grange looking south towards the Promenade" - additional renderings (shown with and without trees) to show promenade from the Dovetail Lane vantage point.
- Sheets AH1-3.1 and AH2-3.1 "Building H1 and H2 Retail & Multi-Family Housing Elevations"- revised building elevations to include a metal arbor with flowering vines to frame the access to the promenade between the two mixed use buildings.

- Sheet L-1.3 "Overall Site Plan" - revised landscaping plan to include crape myrtle canopy trees along the Dovetail Lane entry to the parking lot.
- Sheet L-1.14 "Hotel Tree Planting" - revised plan to include crape myrtle canopy trees along the Dovetail Lane entry to the parking lot.
- Sheet L-1.24 "Enlargement - Retail Street" - revised to include arbor with flowering vine
- Sheet L-1.26 "Enlargement - Promenade" - revised to include the entry (paseo) to the Promenade from Boxheart Drive with the arbor and modified landscaping.
- Sheet L-1.28 "Retail Street Outdoor Furnishing Layout" - revised to include additional bike racks, to include indoor bike racks, and to add dog waste stations.

Exhibit M2 is a letter from Comstock (April 30, 2021) which provides written responses to comments received at the April 13, 2021 Planning Commission workshop.

The application also includes the following documentation:

- Exhibit 5 is the "North Village Mixed-Use Transportation Demand Management (TDM) Plan" (December 23, 2020) prepared by Walker Consultants.
- Exhibit M3 is a memo prepared by W-Trans (April 6, 2021) to address technical issues relating to the design and lay-out of the driveway from the parking lot to Boxheart Drive.
- Exhibit M4 is a memo prepared by Carlile Macy (April 30, 2021) to address Planning Commission questions regarding specifications for street tree plantings.
- Exhibit M5 is a "Tree Inventory Report (Updated)" prepared by the project arborist (April 1, 2021)
- Exhibit M6 is a draft "Vegetation Management Plan" (April 5, 2021) prepared by Firewise 2000, LLC.
- Exhibit M7 is a "Reciprocal Easement Agreement" for the North Village Project.

Additional technical documentation for the North Village project includes a Geotechnical Report (May 2020), Master Hydrology Report (April 2020), Fire Flow Analysis Reports (September 2019; April 2020), Stormwater Low Impact Development Report (January 2021), a Preliminary Title Report, and a Declaration of Reciprocal Easement, Joint Use and Maintenance for the North Village Project.

These documents are available for review on the City of Healdsburg's website at:

<https://www.ci.healdsburg.ca.us/515/Applications-and-Studies-in-Progress>

SITE & VICINITY DESCRIPTION

The 32-acre North Village Project site is located at the northern end of Healdsburg between US 101 and Healdsburg Avenue. The site is bisected by the North Coast Rail Authority ("NCRA") right-of-way which runs roughly parallel to Healdsburg Avenue along the eastern boundary of the site. The NCRA rail corridor is currently inactive but is planned for future passenger rail service operated by Sonoma-Marín Area Rail Transit ("SMART"). Access to the North Village Project is provided via a public, at-grade rail crossing that is located mid-way along the Healdsburg Avenue frontage.

The North Village Mixed Use Project site is centrally located on the North Village site. The 5.1-acre parcel includes a strip along Healdsburg Avenue (east of the NCRA right-of-way) and an approximately 3-acre portion west of the NCRA right-of-way. The Mixed-Use Project would be located on the 3-acre portion to the west of the NCRA right-of-way. The Mixed Use Project site is triangular in shape and is bounded by the North Village site entry road ("Boxheart Drive") to the south and east, by an east-west street ("Dovetail Lane") to the north and by the NCRA right-of-way to the east. These streets are part of

the backbone infrastructure supporting development on the North Village site and are currently under construction.

The Enso Village project has been approved on the property to the south and west of the Mixed Use project site. It will include 221 senior independent living units, 54 assisted living/memory care beds, and associated amenities. The Enso Village project has received all of its entitlements and construction is expected to commence this summer. The property immediately north of the Mixed Use Project site has received master entitlements for a 108-key hotel and related uses and is the subject of a separate Major Conditional Use Permit and Major Design Review application (North Village Hotel). The Montage Healdsburg (formerly known as Saggio Hills) project site is located on the east side of Healdsburg Avenue across from the project site. A luxury resort recently opened on the Montage site and residential development is currently underway. In addition to the resort and residences, the Montage project includes a planned community park, fire substation, and affordable housing that are in various stages of the planning and development review process.

The North Village Project site was previously operated as a lumber mill. Environmental remediation and grading were performed in 2004 in anticipation of future development. At that time, a surface drainage system was installed consisting of swales and a stormwater detention basin. In addition, there are two active faults within the North Village Project site, neither of which traverse the Mixed Use Project site.

BACKGROUND:

The project site is owned by Comstock Healdsburg, LLC, and is located within the North Entry Area Plan ("NEAP") planning area. In May 2019, the Healdsburg City Council certified an Environmental Impact Report and adopted the NEAP and an ordinance amending the Healdsburg Municipal Code to establish implementing regulations for the NEAP. The NEAP establishes a vision concept, land use guidelines, development standards and design guidelines for a new mixed-use neighborhood on the 32-acre North Village site.

In February 2020, the Planning Commission approved a Master Conditional Use Permit (CUP 2020-04; the "Master CUP") to authorize allowable uses and densities and the backbone infrastructure for a mixed-use community known as "North Village" on the 32-acre property. The backbone infrastructure includes a new signalized intersection on Healdsburg Avenue at the site access road (Boxheart Drive). The intersection is aligned with the entryway of a planned Fire Substation on the Montage site. Boxheart Drive enters the North Village site, crosses the NCRA right-of-way and curves to the north. An east-west street (Dovetail Lane) provides secondary access within the site. A secondary emergency vehicle access ("EVA") and rail crossing will provide access from Healdsburg Avenue near the northern boundary of the North Village site. Earlier this year, the City approved improvement plans for construction of the backbone infrastructure to serve future development on the North Village site. The master developer, Comstock Healdsburg, LLC, has begun construction of the shared improvements.

In April 2020, the City Council entered into a Development Agreement ("DA") for the North Village project. The DA and the Master CUP for the North Village project allow for development of up to 301 residential units, approximately 12,000 square feet of commercial space, and a 108-key hotel with a restaurant, bar and other amenities on the North Village site. In exchange for these entitlements, the DA requires the developer to construct a minimum of 15 low- and very low-income units, 39 moderate-income units and 26 middle-income units, plus 30 senior living units affordable to households with very low- and moderate-incomes. In addition, Comstock is required to construct the Fire Substation on a parcel dedicated to the City by the Montage developer (with Comstock's contribution capped at \$2 million plus

funds from Montage), to contribute \$250,000 to the City in "connectivity funds," to enter into a payment-in-lieu of taxes ("PILOT") agreement for the senior living community, and to collect a "hotel community benefit fee" of 1/2 cent on every dollar charged for room occupancy, parking and resort fees to be passed through to the City.

Comstock Healdsburg, LLC, has applied for Design Review and Conditional Use Permits (CUPs) for a 108-key hotel with ancillary facilities and a mixed-use/residential component consisting of 45 multi-family units, 5 live work units, and 12,000 square feet of commercial space. On April 13, 2021, the Planning Commission held a workshop where the North Village development team presented their plans and vision for the North Village Hotel and the Mixed Use Project, discussed the various considerations that informed the design, and received informal feedback from the Planning Commission and the community. In response to feedback received, the applicant has revised the plans and documentation as summarized in Exhibit M2. The Major Design Review Permit and Major Conditional Use Permit applications are now scheduled for a public hearing by the Planning Commission on May 25, 2021.

CONSISTENCY ANALYSIS - HEALDSBURG GENERAL PLAN 2030, NORTH ENTRY AREA PLAN, LAND USE CODE & NORTH VILLAGE DEVELOPMENT AGREEMENT:

When the City approved the Master CUP and Development Agreement for the North Village Project, the Planning Commission and the City Council each made findings that the overall project's geographic location and contemplated categories of uses are consistent with the General Plan, the NEAP, and the applicable provisions of the City's Land Use Code. Accordingly, the City has already determined that the mixed use component of the project consisting of 45 apartments, five live/work units, and approximately 12,000 square feet of commercial retail space are consistent uses, and such determination is vested under the Development Agreement. Therefore, this Design Review and Conditional Use Permit application is focused exclusively on the design, operation, and maintenance of the Mixed Use Project.

A detailed analysis of the consistency of the Mixed Use Project with applicable City policies and regulations relating to design, operation and maintenance issues is provided in the following exhibits and summarized below:

- Exhibit 6 - Healdsburg General Plan 2030 Consistency Analysis
- Exhibit 7 - North Entry Area Plan Consistency Analysis
- Exhibit 8 - Land Use Code Consistency Analysis
- Exhibit 9 - North Village Development Agreement Consistency Analysis

Healdsburg 2030 General Plan

The Healdsburg 2030 General Plan land use designation for the project site is Mixed Use ("MU"). This land use classification provides for a broad range of commercial and residential uses, including multi-family residential, hotels and retail uses. Exhibit 6 presents a table that identifies relevant policies in the General Plan and evaluates the Mixed Use Project's consistency with them. As shown, the Project is consistent with General Plan guiding principles and policies relating to housing, natural resources, safety and community design. The Mixed Use Project is also consistent with General Plan land use policies pertaining to development at the North Entry.

North Entry Area Plan (NEAP)

The Healdsburg 2030 General Plan identifies the northern entry to Healdsburg as an area warranting special study in recognition of its importance both as an attractive gateway into the City and an area of transition from the rural landscape of the Alexander Valley to the more urban core of downtown Healdsburg. In May 2019, the City Council adopted the NEAP to provide specific policies and regulations to guide development on a 32-acre parcel of land located on the west side of Healdsburg Avenue at the north entry to Healdsburg (i.e., the North Village project site). The Mixed Use component of the North Village project would be centrally located on the North Village site. Exhibit 7 presents a table that identifies relevant guiding principles and policies from the NEAP that relate to Land Use, Design, Circulation and Open Space, and Utilities. The table provides an evaluation of the Mixed Use Project's consistency with these planning policies. As summarized in the table, the project is consistent with all of the applicable requirements of the NEAP.

Land Use Code

The Land Use Code contains regulations to implement the policies of the Healdsburg 2030 General Plan, including the NEAP. Applicable Land Use Code regulations for the Mixed Use Project include provisions relating to permitted and conditionally permitted uses; specific development standards for lands within the Mixed Use District and within the NEAP Overlay; and general development standards for parking, landscaping, and refuse and recycling areas. Consistency of the Mixed Use Project with Land Use Code requirements is addressed in Exhibit 8.

North Village Development Agreement

On April 6, 2020, the City Council adopted a Development Agreement by and between the City of Healdsburg and CCS Healdsburg LLC for the North Village Project ("DA"). Specific provisions of the DA pertain to the Mixed Use Project. Exhibit 9 evaluates the proposed consistency of the Mixed Use Project with pertinent sections of the DA. As noted, the timing for some of the DA obligations is in the future.

DISCUSSION/ANALYSIS:

Through the Major Design Review Permit process, the Planning Commission is tasked with ensuring that new development is attractive and enhances the appearance of the community, that the best possible traffic circulation is obtained, that the design and layout of new development projects are in scale and character with surrounding land uses, and that new development projects comply with the Healdsburg General Plan, local area plans and specific plans (in this case, the NEAP), and the Land Use Code.

While a Master Conditional Use Permit was granted for the entire North Village project (CUP 2019-04), a project-specific Major Conditional Use Permit is required for the Mixed Use Project because "residential uses as part of a mixed use development" and "live-work facilities" are designated conditional uses in the Mixed Use/NEAP Overlay zoning district. Subject to the limitations included in the Master CUP and the Development Agreement, discussed above, the Major Conditional Use Permit process allows the Planning Commission to grant and deny applications and impose conditions to ensure that the operation of proposed uses meets the objectives of the Land Use Code and will not adversely affect surrounding properties.

The following discussion focuses on key topics raised by the Planning Commission and community members at the April 13, 2021 workshop for the North Village Hotel and the Mixed Use Project. Exhibit

M2 presents the applicant's response to feedback received at the workshop and summarizes revisions made in the final submittal. Exhibit M8 includes all City Department comments, including comments provided in the pre-application review process, many of which were addressed in subsequent plan revisions.

The reader also is directed to Attachment A of Exhibit 1, draft Planning Commission Resolution No. 2021-08, which sets forth a comprehensive set of Conditions of Approval recommended for the Major Design Review Permit (DR 2021-07) and Major Conditional Use Permit (CUP 2021-04) for the Mixed Use Project. The Conditions of Approval are intended to ensure that the project is consistent with General Plan policies; NEAP policies, development standards and guidelines; and Land Use Code regulations. In addition, the conditions of approval associated with the Master Conditional Use Permit (CUP 2019-04) for the North Village project and mitigation measures identified in the certified Final Environmental Impact Report ("NEAP EIR") for the NEAP adopted through the Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program ("MMRP") remain applicable to the project.

Site Layout and Connectivity

Site Layout. As described in the Narrative Project Description (Exhibit 3) and shown on the Site Plan (Exhibit M1; Sheet A-1.6), the Mixed Use Project is comprised of three buildings, two of which front on Boxheart Drive. The third building is set behind them (to the east) with a courtyard (the "Promenade") located in between. The buildings are arranged to reinforce the street edge with the retail spaces activating Boxheart Drive which is the "main street" in the North Village development. The Promenade, together with the Grange building at the hotel across the street, is envisioned as a "community focal point" in the North Village project.

As summarized in Exhibit 13, the layout of the Mixed Use Project is consistent with the Guiding Principles of the NEAP and the NEAP Design Guidelines.

Sidewalks. Per the Master Conditional Use Permit, the sidewalks on Boxheart Drive from the Healdsburg Avenue intersection to the parking lot driveway are 5' wide with 5' planters. This deviation from the 6' sidewalks envisioned in the NEAP was necessary to accommodate the 26' minimum street width necessary to meet Fire Code requirements for access to buildings that are greater than 30' in height at the eaves. At the driveway to the parking lot on the Mixed Use parcel, the sidewalks transition to a more pedestrian-oriented, plaza style section with 13' wide sidewalks, including a zone along the curb with bollards, streetlights, and tree wells, plus additional private space for seating between the sidewalk and building frontage (Exhibit M1, Sheet L-1.25). The sidewalks along Dovetail Lane are 6' wide. A section of the Perimeter Trail that encircles the entire North Village development is located on the east side of the parking lot. This segment of the trail is 6' wide and surfaced with decomposed granite. The North Village project also includes an extension of the Foss Creek Path along the Healdsburg Avenue frontage, east of the railroad tracks. This Foss Creek Path extensions is part of the backbone infrastructure for the North Village project that is currently under construction.

Connectivity. In response to Planning Commission comments pertaining to connectivity, the design team added a decorative metal trellis with flowering evergreen clematis vines at the Boxheart Drive entry to the breezeway between the two mixed use buildings that connects to the Promenade. This feature will help to accentuate the walkway and draw pedestrians to the Promenade. See Exhibit M1, Sheets L-1.24 and L-1.26.

A mid-block crosswalk on Boxheart Drive is aligned with the breezeway and two other crosswalks are located at the Enso Village site entry and at the Dovetail Lane intersection. The crosswalks are stamped

concrete with integral color as shown on Exhibit M1, Sheet L-1.27. At the April 13, 2021 Planning Commission meeting, a suggestion was made to install a lighted crosswalk or pedestrian warning lights at the mid-block crosswalk to enhance the safety of pedestrians crossing from the Enso Village project. This is not recommended by the City Engineer as the crosswalk would not meet warrants for such enhancements based on pedestrian volumes, the design speed of Boxheart Drive, and anticipated traffic volumes.

The crosswalk on Dovetail Lane between the Promenade and the Grange has been given a special treatment as shown in Exhibit M1, Sheet L-1.26 and described in the applicant's response to comments that were received at the Planning Commission workshop (Exhibit M2):

"The crossing and connection between the Promenade to the Grange is visually emphasized by a combination of details to draw attention to this important crossing and connection. Decorative colored/texture concrete paving at the sidewalk and elevated widened crosswalk, enhanced with truncated dome pavers at the sidewalk edge as well as decorative bollards and streetlights to enhance safety and traffic calming. Decorative pots and a border of perennials/ornamental grasses provide color and interest flanking the sidewalk areas on either side, as well as large-scale shade trees. Night-time lighting of the Grange and Promenade entrances is designed to create a welcoming glow."

At the workshop, a question was raised about connectivity from the east parking lot to the Promenade. As shown on Exhibit M1, Sheets L-1.3 and L-1.26, the primary entry to the Promenade from the east parking lot is via a broad walkway that passes between the south and east buildings. This is centrally located relative to the parking lot and is aligned with the primary residential entries to the east and south buildings. As shown on Sheet AH3-2.1, there are also four walkways from the parking lot to residence ground level entries at the east building and one walkway to an entry near the southeast corner of the south building. Sheet A-1.24 shows the parking lot layout. The reserved residential parking is located on either side of the entryway to the promenade. Shared parking is located at the south end of the parking lot and access to the retail on Boxheart Drive from that location would be via a walkway on the north side of the parking lot driveway.

In addition, as noted in Exhibit 9, the North Village DA addresses connectivity by requiring the North Village project developer to provide shuttles from the North Village site to downtown Healdsburg and to make a \$250,000 contribution to the City for connectivity improvements. Comstock is also required to construct a segment of the Foss Creek Pathway along the Healdsburg Avenue frontage of the entire North Village project site as part of the shared infrastructure improvements.

As summarized in Exhibit 7, the Mixed Use Project is consistent with the Guiding Principles of the NEAP and the NEAP Design Guidelines and policies relating to connectivity.

Vehicular Circulation and Parking

Location of parking lot access driveway. The Traffic Circulation Exhibit for the Mixed Use Project is shown on Exhibit M1; Sheet C-1.07. Primary access is from Boxheart Drive and secondary access is from Dovetail Lane. It is anticipated that most vehicular traffic associated with the residences will utilize the parking lot driveway on Boxheart Drive. Some traffic associated with the retail and adjacent hotel uses would also use this driveway. The alignment of parking lot driveway is staggered with and in between the two driveways to Enso Village on the west side of Boxheart Drive.

The Planning Commission reviewed the alignment of the driveways on Boxheart Drive at the February 2020 Master CUP hearing and included a condition of approval requiring additional analysis and review during subsequent entitlement processes. The Planning Commission approved the Enso Village driveways with their design review permit in November 2020. The Mixed Use Project application includes an Access Evaluation Memo (Exhibit M3) prepared by W-Trans that specifically addresses the driveway from the east parking lot. The memo evaluates sight distances, turn lane warrants, all-way stop-control warrants and queueing. It concludes that the driveway has adequate sight distances for vehicles traveling in both directions on Boxheart Drive, that additional controls and turn lanes at the driveway are not warranted and therefore not recommended, and that queueing along Boxheart Drive is not expected to exceed the distance between the driveway and the rail crossing. A similar analysis performed for the Enso Village driveways concluded that queueing of outbound traffic on Boxheart Drive would not create safety issues.

At the April 13, 2021 workshop, the Planning Commission requested that potential safety concerns related to conflicting turning movements at the east parking lot driveway access on Boxheart Drive be addressed through a special condition would restrict outbound traffic to right turns-only, if warranted by congestion and/or accident data. This would alleviate potential conflicting turning movements by requiring traffic to utilize the traffic circle at the intersection of Boxheart Drive and Dovetail Lane to head southbound on Boxheart Drive. A condition is recommended that will enable the City Engineer to require such signage if and when warranted.

Dovetail Lane access. The segment of Dovetail Lane fronting the Mixed Use site functions as a driveway and then, to the east of the crosswalk linking the Promenade to the Grange, Dovetail Lane becomes the drive aisle of a parking lot with perpendicular parking on each side. Dovetail Lane maintains a 26' width throughout which meets Fire Code requirements.

Parking. Parking for the Mixed Use Project would be provided by a combination of surface parking lots and on-street parking. As shown in Exhibit M1, Sheet A-1.24, a total of 64 spaces in the east parking lot are reserved for the Mixed Use Project. This is consistent with the Shared Parking plan that was approved with the Master CUP. In addition, the retail component would be served by "shared parking" within the North Village Project which includes 17 spaces in the east parking lot, 21 spaces in the Dovetail Lane parking lot, 22 parallel parking spaces on Boxheart Drive, and 13 diagonal spaces on Dovetail Lane. In total, there are 73 shared parking spaces which is 28 more than the 45 spaces identified in the original shared parking plan. The Mixed Use Transportation Demand Management Plan ("TDM Plan") (Exhibit 4) prepared by Walker Consultants estimates that the peak parking demand of the Mixed Use project is 102 spaces. The peak demand hour for the entire project is estimated to be 7 PM on a weekend day in the spring. Walker Consultants concluded that there will be sufficient parking available to meet peak demands.

A condition is recommended that requires submittal of a parking signage plan for City review and approval prior to issuance of permits for the project. In addition, a condition is recommended requiring implementation of the TDM Plan and submittal of annual monitoring reports to provide a process whereby adaptive measures can be required if mobility and shared parking objectives are not met.

Bicycle Facilities. Exhibit M1, Sheet L-1.28 shows the Bike Parking locations, fixtures and quantities. A total of 12 indoor bike parking spaces are provided in the east building and six visitor bike parking spaces are provided at the breezeway and the parking lot entry to the Promenade. While the proposed number of bike parking spaces exceeds CALGreen standards, the outdoor bike racks are not situated in highly visible locations. A special condition is recommended requiring the applicant to install additional

bike racks at a convenient and visible location(s) along the street frontage of the Mixed Use parcel subject to review and approval by the Planning & Building Director.

TDM Plan. The Mixed Use TDM Plan (Exhibit 4) was prepared to identify a transportation and mobility strategy that will provide residents, visitors and employees with access to multiple transportation options and viable alternatives to driving alone.

Both the North Village Hotel and the Enso Village senior living community are planning to offer a shuttle service to and from downtown Healdsburg. The shuttle service will be made available to residents, visitors and employees of the Mixed Use project. The TDM Plan notes:

"The future management of the mixed-use development may also consider contributing funding to the operation of the shuttles and/or adding a third shuttle vehicle to increase frequency of operation and opportunities for everyone in the development. Frequent shuttle service and extended hours of operation throughout the day and the week, from morning to evening, provide a reliable and dependable service option that can significantly reduce the need of residents, visitors and employees to drive their own vehicle, as they will have an alternative means of getting around and access work, medical, social, grocery shopping and recreational opportunities in Downtown Healdsburg."

In addition to the shuttles, direct access to Sonoma County Transit Route 60 service will be provided at bus stops located on either side of Healdsburg Avenue at the North Village project entry.

Exhibit 4 includes two tables (starting on p. 11) that identify project design measures and transportation program measures to encourage reduction of single vehicle trips. A special condition is recommended requiring implementation of a coordinated and integrated TDM program with annual reporting to the City in order to ensure the effectiveness of the TDM program in meeting the mobility and shared parking objectives.

Aesthetics

Building design and views. The Plan Set includes a Narrative Description (Exhibit M1, Sheet G-0.4 which explains the guiding principles for design of the new mixed-use neighborhood. The building design was inspired by the agrarian and rural character of the area. Building forms are simple with low pitched gable roofs. Buildings are clad with traditional materials like standing seam metal roofs, board and batten siding and natural stone. The buildings on the Mixed Use site step down towards Healdsburg Avenue with 3-story structures adjacent to Boxheart Drive and a two story component on the easternmost portion of the site. This is clearly illustrated in the "Project Entry View from Healdsburg Avenue (without trees) rendering (Exhibit M1, Sheet A-1.12).

The applicant's design team has provided a number of renderings depicting views of the Mixed Use Project from a number of vantage points (both with and without trees). Sheets A-1.9 and A-1.10 show a view from Healdsburg Avenue looking north from a viewpoint to the south of the site entry. Sheets A-1.11 and A-1.12 show the project from a viewpoint on Boxheart Drive just east of the railroad tracks near the site entry. Sheets A-1.13 and A-1.14 show views of the retail frontage on Boxheart Drive. Sheets A-1.15 and A-1.16 show a view of the Promenade from its southerly end, looking north towards the Grange. Sheets A-1.16.1 and A-1.16.2 show a view of the Promenade from a viewpoint looking south from Dovetail Lane.

Exterior lighting. The lighting plans are included in Exhibit M1, Sheets EL1.10 - EL3.00. Sheets EL 2.06 and EL2.07 provide the details for lighting on the Mixed Use Project site. Overhead catenary

lighting will be strung over the Promenade and the breezeway entry to Boxheart Drive. Pedestrian scaled (14') pole lighting is provided at the parking lot entry. Taller (18') fixtures are used along the parking lot and street frontages. Building facades are lit with wall-mounted sconces and downlights. Walkways to the ground floor residences are lit with small bollard path lights. All of the proposed fixtures are dark-sky compliant.

Landscape Design

Mixed Use Parcel Landscape Plans. Exhibit M1, Sheet L-01.3 shows the overall site plan for the Mixed Use site and illustrates the location and spacing of trees along the street frontages, Promenade, and in the parking lot. Sheet L-1.14 shows the Tree Planting Plan for the parking lot and Dovetail Lane frontage of the Mixed Use parcel. Sheets L-1.16 and L-1.17 shows the Shrubs and Groundcover Planting. With the exception of three accent trees (red maples) on the east side of the east building, all of the landscaping shown on these sheets is either very low- or low- water use. The red maples require moderate water use. The Promenade Tree Planting is shown on Sheet L-1.29. Red maples and crape myrtles are proposed for the Promenade and street crossing. The crape myrtles are a low water use species. In response to Planning Commission comments, crape myrtles were added along the Dovetail Lane parking area at the entry to the east parking lot. These trees will help shade the pedestrian walkways along this frontage.

At the April 13, 2021 Planning Commission workshop, Commissioners noted a desire to see the largest street trees possible. Exhibit M4 is a memo from the project landscape architect explaining that the larger shade trees along Boxheart Drive are specified at 36" box size. Smaller ornamental trees are specified at 24" box size. To accentuate the project entry and the traffic circle at the Boxheart Drive/Dovetail Lane intersection, 60" box trees are specified. These larger trees will be located in planter areas with more growing space to thrive. The specifications also include installation of Silva Cells for the street trees. the Silva Cells are a modular suspended pavement system that provides additional uncompacted soil volumes to better support large tree growth.

Tree preservation. The applicant submitted a Tree Inventory Report (Exhibit M5) prepared by an arborist. The report identified two existing trees on the south side of the east parking lot on the Mixed Use parcel that are identified as #1 and #2 in the inventory. Both are Coast Live Oaks that are approximately 16 feet in height and in good health. While neither tree is considered a heritage tree, both are identified as having excellent suitability for preservation and on minor impacts would be expected as a result of proposed development. The trees are shown on the preliminary grading plan (Exhibit M1, Sheet C.1.0-3) and are outside of the area to be graded. Conditions of approval are recommended to ensure that sufficient tree protection measures are specified in construction plans for work in the vicinity of the retained trees.

Landscape maintenance requirements. A Reciprocal Easement Agreement for the entire North Village Project (Exhibit M7) establishes shared easements throughout the project in order to benefit and share expenses within such easements, including a "Grant of Easement for Surface Maintenance of Private Streets Easement Area. Article 1, Section 40 defines the term "Surface Maintenance" to mean:

"...the maintenance, repair, reconstruction and replacement, and operation [...]of plantings (including trees, shrubbery, ground cover and other landscape materials), walls or fences, lighting fixtures and lights, an irrigation system including irrigation pipes, fittings and wiring, sidewalk, pathway, hardscape and landscape and related Improvements, weed abatement, electric pedestal meters, water meters, landscape area drainage, planting and replanting, landscape maintenance, garbage pick-up, power, water and all other utility charges, including without limitation,

improvements or changes arising by operation or requirements of law, as necessary and appropriate for the use and upkeep of the surface of such Easement Area, and the correction, remedy, and repair of the effects of wear and tear, natural conditions, damage, erosion, acts of God, or other causes, so as to allow the full and proper use of such Easement for the use and benefit of the Parcel Owners benefitted by such Easement and their respective Permittees."

The responsibility for completion of Surface Maintenance is assigned to a "Maintenance Manager." The Maintenance Manager responsibility is initially assigned to the Owner of Parcel 1 (Enso Village) but may be changed to the Owner of Parcel 3 (North Village Hotel). The other Mixed Use and Affordable/Workforce Housing parcels may not assume the responsibilities of Maintenance Manager.

Article 3 of the Reciprocal Easement Agreement establishes the "General Rules Applicable to Use, Maintenance and Construction." At the April 13, 2021 Planning Commission workshop on the North Village Hotel and the Mixed Use Project, the Planning Commission expressed concern about the standards that would be applied to the maintenance of street landscaping. A special condition is recommended requiring the Reciprocal Easement Agreement to be amended to include a provision establishing a standard for landscape maintenance within the Private Streets Easement Area as follows:

"All landscape operation, maintenance, repair, reconstruction and replacement within the Private Streets Easement Area shall be performed in a first class and workmanlike manner in accordance with best landscaping practices, including regular mowing, edging, trimming, weeding, irrigation, fertilization, pest control, pruning and replacement of plant materials as needed."

Operational Considerations

Compatibility of mixed uses. The proposed Mixed Use Project will include ground floor retail uses fronting on Boxheart Drive with residential uses on the upper stories. The live-work units are located on the ground floor of building and front on the Promenade. Residential uses are on the ground floor of the portions of the east and south buildings fronting the parking lot. The primary conflict that can occur when commercial and residential uses are co-located relates to noise associated with commercial uses. While restaurants are a permitted use in the NEAP Overlay zone and sidewalk cafes utilizing the Boxheart Drive frontage and/or the Promenade are contemplated, "amplified music that is audible from outside of the building" and "extended hours" require a conditional use permit. A special condition is recommended to address these issues and to ensure that all applicable building codes and access requirements are met, as follows:

"Prior to issuance of a business license for a retail establishment with outdoor dining on the Mixed Use Parcel, both the Planning & Building Director and Public Works Director must find that all applicable building codes and accessibility requirements are met. All commercial uses shall comply with the City's noise ordinance (HMC, Chapter 9.32) which limits nighttime exterior sound levels to 60 dBA L₁₀ between the hours of 8:00 PM to 7:00 AM."

Public restrooms. The Master CUP (CUP 2019-04) requires that the Mixed Use Project provide public restrooms for the users of the Promenade. As shown on Exhibit M1, Sheet AH2-2.1, two public restrooms are located at the southeast corner of the retail space fronting on the breezeway to the Promenade.

Designated pet use areas. At the April 13, 2021 Planning Commission workshop, a question was raised regarding how the project design accommodates the needs of dogs. In Exhibit M2, the applicant has indicated that their preferred method for addressing the needs of resident and visiting pets is to provide Dog Waste Stations at strategic ingress points to walking paths and trails on the North Village Site. The

dog waste stations include a combo bag dispenser/ disposal bin. As shown on Exhibit M1, Sheet L-1.28, Dog Waste stations would be located at the southeastern corner where the perimeter trail enters the parking lot and at a location immediately opposite the parking lot entry to the Mixed Use Project. A generous landscaping strip is adjacent to the trail at this location. The Landscape Plan, Exhibit M1, Sheet L-1.16, indicates that this area will be landscaped with grasses, groundcover, rocks and boulders. Pet owners will also have opportunities to exercise their pets on the perimeter trail and/or at the community park that is planned on the east side of Healdsburg Avenue.

Usable open space. HMC Section 20.08.175(B) requires a minimum of 200 square feet of usable open space per dwelling unit, unless the requirement is reduced or waived by the Planning Commission in consideration of open space or recreational facilities that are available within reasonable proximity. HMC Section 20.20.15 establishes that required open spaces may be either common or private open space and that each square foot of private open space shall be considered the equivalent of two square feet of common open space and may be so substituted. For the 50 residential units, 10,000 square feet of open space is required. As shown on Exhibit M1, Sheet AH-1.1, the second and third floor residences on the Multi-Use parcel have private balconies, with space totaling 7,125 square feet (which is the equivalent of 14,250 square feet of common open space). Other common open space on-site includes the Promenade, a shade-covered courtyard that has two water features for children's play. In addition, the Perimeter Trail provides linear access through the open space along the north and west perimeters of the North Village project and the Foss Creek Pathway extension along the site's eastern boundary will provide bicycle and pedestrian access to downtown Healdsburg and beyond. Lastly, the site is across the street from a the 36-acre community park that is planned for development on the east side of Healdsburg Avenue.

Refuse storage area. The site plan (Exhibit M1, Sheet A-1.6) shows a "dumpster" in the east parking lot, across from the driveway access to Boxheart Drive. HMC Section 20.16.070 establishes requirements for refuse and recycling storage areas. Fire and Building Code requirements also apply. A special condition is recommended requiring that the design of the storage structure be consistent with the development and subject to review and approval by the planning director prior to issuance of permits.

Compliance with Water Efficient Landscape Ordinance

Land Use Code Section 20.16.105 establishes the City's water-efficient landscaping requirements. It is intended to implement a "whole systems approach to design, construction, installation and maintenance of the landscape resulting in water-conserving climate-appropriate landscapes." Compliance with this objective is especially important given the increasing frequency of drought-related water shortages in the region.

Since the April 13, 2021, Planning Commission workshop on the North Village Hotel and Mixed Use Project, the applicant has submitted separate Water Efficient Landscape Worksheets for the Mixed Use Project and the Hotel. The worksheet for the Mixed Use Project (Exhibit 5) indicates that the entire landscape area (17,350 SF) is in a low water use hydrozone and the Estimated Total Water Use ("ETWU") for the Mixed Use Project is 162,388 gallons per year.

Vegetation management. The North Village Project is located in a "Moderate Fire Hazard Severity Zone" as specified by CalFire and the Healdsburg 2030 General Plan. The applicant has submitted a draft Vegetation Management Plan ("VMP") (Exhibit M6) prepared by Firewise 2000, LLC. The VMP assesses on-site and off-site wildland fire hazards and risks that may threaten the North Village project. Enso Village has prepared a separate VMP for their 16-acre parcel. The North Village VMP includes a map delineating "fuel modification zones" within the development. Fuel modification immediate zone 1

is the area within 5' of the exterior walls of the buildings. Within zone 1, no combustible materials are permitted other than scattered potted plants or groundcover from approved plant lists. Fuel modification irrigated zone 2 includes the landscaped and irrigated zones which will be planted with drought tolerant, fire resistant and irrigated fire-resistant lawns, ground covers, low growing shrubs, and occasional fire-resistant trees. Fuel modification zone 3 is a non-irrigated zone where shrub vegetation is thinned, trees are limbed up, and dead and dying vegetation is removed on an on-going basis, as needed.

A special condition is recommended requiring that the landscaping plans must be reviewed and approved by the planning department and fire marshal, in consultation with the VMP preparer, to ensure consistency with the final VMP.

Secondary emergency access and evacuation. The North Village Project has a secondary emergency vehicle access ("EVA") from Healdsburg Avenue which crosses the railroad tracks at a location near the northeast corner of the project area. The EVA is being installed as part of the shared improvements for the project and, per the Master CUP, the EVA must be in place prior to the storage of flammable materials on site and/or vertical construction. Additionally, an amendment to the North Village Reciprocal Easement Agreement was recently prepared to assign the Maintenance Manager the responsibility to serve as a "Mobility Coordinator" for the North Village Project to plan for and provide tactical coordination and conduct town-hall meetings to cover emergency evacuations and other safety issues.

FINDINGS

Design Review Permit Findings

Pursuant to Land Use Code section 20.28.125, the Planning Commission is required to make the following five findings in order to approve a Major Design Review Permit. Suggested language to support each finding is shown in *italicized text* below each finding:

A. The proposed development or use is consistent with all applicable policies and requirements of the General Plan and Land Use Code.

The proposed North Village Mixed Use project is a commercial use type that is permitted within the Mixed Use "MU" land use classification in the Healdsburg 2030 General Plan. Prior approvals of the Master Conditional Use Permit (CUP 2019-04) and the Development Agreement (DA 2020-01) for the North Village Project determined that the mix of uses and densities proposed on the Mixed Use Project site are consistent with the General Plan. The Mixed Use Project advances General Plan policies encouraging development of a variety of housing types to address housing needs in the community, including affordable housing. The Project is also consistent with General Plan policies encouraging mixed use development. The Project is consistent with the vision, guiding principles, policies and guidelines of the North Entry Area Plan (NEAP) which was adopted as an amendment to the Healdsburg 2030 General Plan. The North Village Mixed Use project complies with the requirements of the Mixed Use "MU" zoning classification and the North Entry Area Plan "NEAP" Overlay as established in the Land Use Code (Healdsburg Municipal Code, Title 20) as discussed in detail in the staff report and Exhibit 7 and Exhibit 8 for the May 25, 2021, Planning Commission hearing for DR 2021-07 and CUP 2021-04.

- B. The proposed design of the development or use, and all appurtenant structures, is consistent with the policies set forth in the Citywide Design Guidelines, as may be amended from time to time.**

Although the Citywide Design Guidelines are applicable to all projects subject to Major and Minor design review, they are only mandatory within "Character Area 1." In areas subject to a specific Area Plan, such as the NEAP, the Area Plan provides design guidelines and standards, and the Citywide Design Guidelines are only used to provide additional information about topics not addressed within the Area Plan. The North Village Mixed Use Project site is located within the planning area for the NEAP, which establishes comprehensive design standards for the Mixed Use Project. Therefore, the project design was evaluated for consistency with the design guidelines established in the NEAP. See discussion below for Finding E.

- C. The proposed development or use is consistent with the purposes of the zoning district in which it is located.**

The North Village Mixed Use Project includes multi-family residential uses, live-work units and retail uses. This mix of uses was determined to be consistent with the special purposes of the MU District and the NEAP Overlay when the Planning Commission granted a Master Conditional Use Permit (CUP 2019-04) for the North Village Project on February 11, 2020. The Mixed Use Project includes "residential uses as part of a mixed use development" and "live-work facilities" which are use types that require a site-specific conditional use permit. The Major Conditional Use Permit (CUP 2021-04) has been considered in conjunction with this Major Design Review Permit (DR 2021-07). The proposed residential and retail uses are generally consistent with the zoning district, and as conditioned, the Project is consistent with the zoning district's specific requirements.

- D. The proposed development or use is consistent with all other conditions imposed by the Planning Commission or City Council with respect to any matter related to the purpose of design review.**

The proposed North Village Mixed Use Project is consistent with the NEAP, the Master Conditional Use Permit for the North Village Project (CUP 2019-04), and the North Village Development Agreement (DA 2020-01). All applicable conditions associated with the Master Conditional Use Permit are incorporated into this approval. The Mixed Use Project is also required to comply with all applicable mitigations of the Final Environmental Impact Report for the North Entry Area Plan (NEAP FEIR) and the NEAP FEIR Addendum, as presented in the adopted Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program (NEAP MMRP).

- E. For proposed developments or uses in the North Entry Area Plan Overlay, the design of the development or use, and all appurtenant structures, is consistent with the goals, policies, objectives and design guidelines set forth in the North Entry Area Plan, as adopted by the Healdsburg City Council on May 20, 2019, as may be amended from time to time.**

As detailed in the staff report and Exhibit 7 for Major Design Review Permit DR 2021-07 (NEAP Consistency Analysis), the proposed Mixed Use Project is consistent with the Guiding Principles, Land Use & Development Standards, and Design Guidelines established in the NEAP.

Conditional Use Permit Findings

Pursuant to Land Use Code Section 20.28.165, the Planning Commission is required to make the following findings in order to approve a conditional use permit. Suggested language to support each finding is shown in *italicized text* below each finding:

A. The proposed location and operation of the conditional use is in accord with the Healdsburg general plan and any applicable planned development, specific or area plan.

The entire North Village Project site is designated Mixed Use (MU) in the Healdsburg General Plan and is subject to the policies and guidelines of the North Entry Area Plan (NEAP). As detailed in the staff report for Major Design Review Permit DR 2021-07 and Exhibit 6 (Healdsburg 2030 General Plan Consistency Analysis) and Exhibit 6 (NEAP Consistency Analysis), the proposed North Village Mixed Use Project is consistent with the Healdsburg 2030 General Plan and the NEAP.

B. The proposed location and operation of the conditional use is consistent with the applicable development standards of this Land Use Code.

The residential uses in the North Village Mixed Use Project include multi-family residences and live-work units, both of which require a site-specific conditional use permit. Both the use type and the project location are consistent with the Mixed Use (MU) District and the North Entry Area Plan (NEAP) Overlay as established in the Land Use Code. As detailed in the staff report for Major Design Review Permit DR 2021-07 and Exhibit 8 (Land Use Code Consistency Analysis), the Mixed Use Project complies with the applicable development standards of the Land Use Code.

C. The proposed location of the conditional use and the conditions under which it would be operated and maintained will not be detrimental to public health and safety or materially injurious to uses, properties or improvements in the vicinity.

The location of the North Village Mixed Use Project site is in a Mixed Use (MU) District, surrounded by lands within the North Village Project site to the north, west and south and the NCRA railroad right-of-way, Healdsburg Avenue and the Montage Healdsburg development to the east. The NEAP EIR determined that the North Village Project as a whole would not significantly impact properties or improvements in the immediate vicinity of the site. The NEAP Final EIR and the NEAP MMRP include mitigation measures to ensure that construction-related activities do not result in impacts to nearby properties and/or uses. Based on the analysis in the NEAP EIR and its required mitigation measures, the proposed North Village Mixed Use Project will not result in or create a detrimental condition on the property, property vicinity or within the community.

ALTERNATIVES:

The Planning Commission may consider the following alternative actions:

Staff Recommendation – Approve Resolution No. 2021-08 (Exhibit 1) approving Major Design Review Permit DR 2021-07 and Major Conditional Use Permit (CUP 2021-04) for development of the North Village Mixed Use Project, based on the suggested findings and subject to the recommended conditions of approval.

Alternative 1 – Approve Resolution No. 2021-08 (Exhibit 1) with modifications based on changes identified at the Planning Commission hearing.

Alternative 2 – Continue action on the applications in order for the applicant to address design-related concerns and require that revised plans be brought back to the Planning Commission for future action. This would likely require noticing of a future public hearing.

Alternative 3 – Continue action on the applications and provide direction to staff to prepare a resolution for denial based on inconsistencies with applicable City regulations or policies. This would require noticing of a future public hearing.

ENVIRONMENTAL ANALYSIS:

During the NEAP planning process, an Environmental Impact Report ("NEAP EIR") was prepared to analyze the potential project and cumulative environmental impacts associated with future development under the NEAP (State Clearinghouse No. 2018062041). The NEAP EIR found that, with the implementation of mitigation measures identified in the EIR, all significant impacts could be reduced to a less than significant level except for the traffic impacts and safety hazards at the U.S. 101/Dry Creek Road intersection and the Dry Creek Road/Grove Street intersection. These impacts were identified as significant unavoidable adverse impacts and pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15083, a Statement of Overriding Considerations was adopted as part of the City Council resolution certifying the NEAP EIR. On May 20, 2019, the City Council certified the NEAP EIR and adopted a Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program ("NEAP MMRP") to ensure that mitigation measures identified in the EIR are implemented. The Draft and Final EIRs are included as Exhibit M9 and Exhibit M10, respectively. The NEAP MMRP is included as Exhibit M11.

Review of the MCUP application for the North Village project involved preparation of an Environmental Checklist in order to determine whether and to what extent the NEAP EIR remained sufficient to address the potential impacts of the project. The analysis included updated traffic modeling and greenhouse gas emissions analysis to account for the specific uses proposed. An Addendum to the NEAP EIR was prepared, pursuant to Public Resources Code section 21166 and CEQA Guidelines section 15164, to document the City's review of the North Village project (Exhibit M12). As explained in the Addendum, the City determined that the North Village Project did not warrant preparation of a new subsequent or supplemental EIR as it involved no new significant environmental effects and would not result in a substantial increase in the severity of previously identified significant effects.

For the Mixed Use Project, which is a component of the North Village Project, the City has identified the following applicable CEQA streamlining and/or tiering code sections, each of which, separately and independently, provides a basis for the project's CEQA compliance:

- A. A Community Plan Exemption, pursuant to Public Resources Code section 21083.3 and CEQA Guidelines section 15183;
- B. Reliance on the NEAP EIR as a Program EIR, pursuant to CEQA Guidelines section 15168.

As explained in the Addendum, the Environmental Checklist found that the North Village Project did not warrant preparation of a new subsequent or supplemental EIR as it involves no new significant environmental effects and would not result in a substantial increase in the severity of previously identified significant effects.

The proposed North Village Mixed Use Project is consistent with the NEAP and the Master CUP; it proposes the same development program in substantially the same footprint for development as the City previously reviewed and approved. The project is within the broader development assumptions analyzed

in the EIR and would not cause new significant environmental impacts not previously identified in the EIR or result in a substantial increase in the severity of previously identified significant unavoidable impacts. Therefore, the Addendum provides substantial evidence to support the conclusion that the potential environmental impacts associated with the North Village Mixed Use Project have already been adequately analyzed in the NEAP EIR that the City previously certified, and no further review or analysis under CEQA is required.

Based on an examination of the analysis, findings, and conclusions of the NEAP EIR and Addendum, the potential impacts of the proposed North Village Mixed Use Project remain within the impacts previously analyzed and disclosed in the NEAP EIR. Therefore, per CEQA Guidelines sections 15162, 15164, and 15183 no further analysis is required under CEQA before taking action on the Major Design Review Permit and Major Conditional Use Permit for the North Village Mixed Use Project.

FISCAL INFORMATION:

The North Village Mixed Use project is a privately funded development. The project will generate property and sales tax revenues which will help to offset the City's costs of providing services to the project.

DEPARTMENT COMMENTS:

The North Village Mixed Use Project applications were referred to City Departments, the City Arborist, SMART and Recology for review and comment. Comments received are included as Exhibit M8 and, where applicable, information and suggested conditions are integrated into the recommended conditions of approval for the Project.

EXHIBITS:

Note: Exhibits M9, M10, M11, and M12, as identified below, are available electronically on the City of Healdsburg website and in the online agenda packet for the May 25, 2021 Planning Commission meeting.

Master North Village Project Exhibits:

- M1 - North Village Plan Set (05/25/21)
- M2 - Comstock Responses to PC Workshop Comments (04/30/21)
- M3 - Access Evaluation Memo (W-Trans, 04/06/21)
- M4 - Street Tree Memo (Carlile Macy, 04/30/21)
- M5 - Tree Inventory Report-Updated (Horticultural Associates, 04/01/21)
- M6 - Draft Vegetation Management Plan (Firewise 2000, 04/05/21)
- M7 - North Village Project Reciprocal Easement Agreement
- M8 - City Department Comments (Hotel & Mixed Use Projects)
- M9 - Draft NEAP EIR (First Carbon Solutions; 11/30/18)
- M10 - Final NEAP EIR (First Carbon Solutions; 4/09/19)
- M11 - NEAP MMRP (First Carbon Solutions; 2/11/20)
- M12 - NEAP Addendum (First Carbon Solutions; 2/04/20)
- M13 - Correspondence Received (prior to publication of 05/25/21 packet)

North Village Mixed Use Project - Exhibits

1. PC Resolution No. 2021-08
2. Site Vicinity Map- Mixed Use Project
3. North Village Mixed Use Project Narrative (04/05/21)
4. North Village Mixed Use Transportation Demand Management (TDM) Plan (12/23/20)
5. North Village Mixed Use- Updated WELO Calculations for Parcel 4 (05/19/21)
6. Healdsburg General Plan 2030 Consistency Analysis- Mixed Use Project
7. North Entry Area Plan Consistency Analysis- Mixed Use Project
8. Land Use Code Consistency Analysis- Mixed Use Project
9. North Village Development Agreement Consistency Analysis- Mixed Use Project