



Agenda Item #:	<u>4B</u>
Meeting Date:	<u>November 1, 2022</u>
Prepared By:	<u>Joel Galbraith, Senior Planner</u>
Reviewed By:	<u>Scott M. Duiven</u> Scott M. Duiven Community Development Director

**REQUEST FOR PLANNING COMMISSION ACTION**

**PROJECT TITLE:** Healdsburg Avenue Apartments  
**SUBJECT:** Design Review DR 2017-17 and Heritage Tree Permit HT 2021-02  
**PROPERTY ADDRESS:** 3 Healdsburg Avenue  
**ASSESSOR PARCELS:** APN 088-170-003  
**PROJECT SITE ZONING:** Multi-Family Residential (RM)  
**GENERAL PLAN DESIG.:** High Density Residential (HR) (10-20 UPA)  
**APPLICANT:** Ted Hollen, KHE Holdings, LLC

**PROPERTY OWNER:** KHE Holdings, LLC

**RECOMMENDED ACTION:**

Conduct a public hearing on Design Review Application DR 2017-17 and Heritage Tree Permit HT 2021-02 and by motion approve Resolution No. 2022-01 approving Design Review and Heritage Tree Permit based on the suggested findings and subject to the recommended conditions of approval (**Attachment 1**).

**BACKGROUND:**

On January 11, 2022, the Planning Commission continued the public hearing for this project at the applicant's request (and due to technical issues) to allow the applicant time to conduct neighborhood outreach and incorporate design changes in response to comments received leading up to the Planning Commission Public Hearing. At the January 11, 2022, Planning Commission Hearing, Staff stated that it was the applicant's intent to bring the project back to the Planning Commission for a workshop prior to resubmitting formal revisions.

The applicant met with local design professionals on April 5, 2022, and with the neighborhood on April 27, 2022, to discuss possible revisions and to receive feedback. In response to comments received leading up to the continued January 11, 2022, Planning Commission Hearing, and comments received from design professionals and neighbors the applicant revised the project and on May 6, 2022, the applicant submitted an application requesting a Planning Commission Workshop.

On May 24, 2022, Planning Commission conducted a Workshop to provide initial design feedback on the project design. The major project revision proposed included rotating the three buildings facing Kennedy Lane and Healdsburg Avenue to allow each unit to access directly out to the public sidewalk rather than to the internal parking lot, and the design of Building B located at the intersection of Healdsburg Avenue and Kennedy Lane has been modified to include a three-foot vertical offset to provide additional visual interest at the highly visible northeast corner of the development.

Most of the Planning Commissioners seemed generally supportive of the design and the following issues were identified by individual Commission members:

1. Include laundry facilities in each unit.
2. Modify balconies to provide more privacy and screening.
3. Include bike parking/storage detail.
4. Cover ADA parking.
5. Provide solar panels.
6. Provide details regarding water conservation and provide a recycled water tank.
7. Apartment entrances (front doors) should be more visible, and stairways should be less visible.
8. Improve project appearance at the intersection including stepping the building, improve roof lines, and preserve existing trees at the intersection.
9. Provide traffic analysis to evaluate potential impacts to Kennedy Lane and Healdsburg Avenue intersection and to determine if a turn-lane is warranted.
10. Provide an on-site manager.

On August 8, 2022, the applicant submitted revised plans which are now before the Planning Commission for a public hearing and decision. Major project clarifications and modifications incorporated since the Workshop include the following:

1. The applicant has clarified that laundry facilities are proposed within each unit.
2. The interior plumbing fixtures comply with Cal Green water flow rates.
3. Balcony railings have been modified by replacing the hog wire panels with more traditional vertical slats.
4. A covered bike parking detail has been included.
5. All three ADA parking spaces include a carport.
6. The carports include solar panels
7. The internal walkway access proposed at the intersection has been removed to provide additional landscaping.
8. An on-site manager will be provided as required by State law for apartment projects with 16 or more units.

## **PROJECT DESCRIPTION SUMMARY:**

The applicant is requesting Design Review and Heritage Tree Permit approval to construct a new 30-unit apartment project on a 1.232-acre site located at the southwest corner of Healdsburg Avenue and Kennedy Lane. Two of the 30 units would be restricted as affordable housing for a period of 55 years and an additional 12 units would be restricted to middle income households for a period of 55 years. The applicant has requested a Density Bonus to increase the number of allowed dwellings from 24 to the proposed 30 units. The project also includes the removal of 5 existing detached rental units.

The 30 apartments are stacked flats proposed within five, two-story buildings. Units are 1-, 2-, and 3-bedroom apartments ranging in size from 490 square feet to 1,029 square feet. The unit count will be as follows: 4 one-bedroom units, 18 two-bedroom units and 8 three-bedroom units. A total of 45 on-site parking spaces are proposed with one two-way access driveway from Healdsburg Avenue.

## **SITE & VICINITY DESCRIPTION:**

The property comprises approximately 1.232 acres of relatively level land located at the southwest corner of Healdsburg Avenue and Kennedy Lane and just west of the Healdsburg Avenue bridge and the Russian River. The site contains five relatively small, detached homes with a semi-rural character due to significant amount of vegetation and the lack of curbs, gutters and sidewalks. The site is heavily wooded with a variety of mature oak, redwood, silver maples and palms. The project site is highly visible due the property's prominent location at a signalized intersection adjacent to the Healdsburg Avenue Bridge.

Adjacent uses include the Riverview Estates mobile/manufactured home neighborhood to the south, veterinary hospital to the west, trailer park and solar company to the north, and the Russian River to the east. The Aerial and Zoning Maps are included in **Attachments 3 and 4**.

## **PROPOSED AFFORDABLE AND MIDDLE-INCOME HOUSING:**

### **City of Healdsburg Inclusionary Ordinance (IHO) and the State Density Bonus Law**

The City of Healdsburg chose to require certain housing developments to include affordable housing with the adoption of the Healdsburg IHO in 1998. Cities are not required to adopt an IHO. The current IHO requires that 20% of units be rent or sales price restricted to moderate or below moderate-income levels.

In 1979 the State Legislature enacted the Density Bonus Law, Section 65915 to reward developers that choose to construct affordable and senior housing by requiring cities to approve a density bonus which allows the developer to construct more units than would otherwise be permitted. Through the state density bonus regulations (Government Code § 65915) most developers can request up to a 50% density bonus based upon the number of affordable units proposed, and an 80% increase in densities for projects which are completely affordable. The state regulations are meant to incentivize the production of affordable housing and any housing developer can elect to take advantage of the allowances created. While the State Density Bonus Law can be complicated, the courts have clarified certain provisions and the relationship between the State Density Bonus Law and a local IHO. The courts have determined affordable units required by an IHO can be used by a developer to request a density bonus. The courts

and the Healdsburg Land Use Code have also clarified that the “bonus units” are market-rate units that are added to the project as an incentive to construct affordable housing and the bonus units are exempt from the IHO.

The project applicant is proposing to construct a total of 30 new rental apartments (24 base units + 6 bonus units) to replace the five existing rental homes on the property. The applicant is proposing to include two very low-income units consistent with the Healdsburg IHO and the State Density Bonus Law and 12 middle-income (“Measure P”) units as follows:

Healdsburg Land Use Code 20.20.030 -Inclusionary Housing (IHO)

The Land Use Code requires a minimum 20% of units be rent or sales price restricted to what would be affordable to moderate or below moderate-income levels. The Land Use Code exempts the six bonus units, the five replacement units, Measure P middle-income units, and the four units 850 square feet or less in size, from the provisions of the IHO.

The IHO calculation is as follows:

*30 units proposed*

*minus 6 density bonus units*

*minus 5 replacement units*

*minus 13 Category C (Measure P middle-income) units*

*minus 4 units that are 850 square feet or less in size*

*= 2 units subject to the IHO*

*x 20% IHO requirement*

*= 0.4 affordable units required. (The applicant may choose to round up to a whole unit or pay the fractional amount as an in-lieu fee)*

Rather than pay this fractional amount as an in-lieu fee, the applicant is choosing to provide two affordable units to take advantage of provisions allowed by State Density Bonus Law as discussed below.

State Density Bonus Law

The project site is located within the High Density Residential (HR) General Plan Land Use Designation which permits multifamily housing with a density range of 10 to 20 units per acre. Based upon the project site size of 1.232 acres, the maximum number of allowed units on the site is 24. The applicant is proposing to restrict 8% (2 units) of the 24 allowed units to very low-income households which qualifies the project for up to a 27.5% density bonus. The applicant is proposing a 25% density bonus.

The State Density Bonus calculation is as follows:

24 base units

x 27.5% Bonus for providing 8% or 2 units as Very Low-Income units

= 6.6 bonus units rounds up to 7 bonus units allowed (6 bonus units proposed)

+24 base units

= 31 total units allowed (30 total units proposed)

Based upon the number of very low-income units proposed, the applicant is entitled up to a maximum of 7 market rate bonus units. The applicant has chosen to provide 6 bonus units which increases the number of allowed units from 24 to a total of 30 proposed units.

The two very low-income units proposed as a part to the State Density Bonus application more than achieve the IHO requirement. In summary, the project as proposed meets the requirements of both the IHO and the State Density Bonus Law.

Overall, the proposed Healdsburg Avenue Apartment unit mix will be:

2 Very Low-income units (Affordable)

+ 13 Middle-income units (Missing Middle)

+ 15 Market rate units (Unrestricted)

= **30 total units**

The number of middle-income units may increase by 10 to 23 units and the number of market-rate units may decrease by 10 to 5 units based upon the number of Category B Allocations available at the time of project approval.

The IHO also requires the affordable units to reflect the range of number of bedrooms in the project as a whole. The project includes one-, two-, and three-bedroom units and to comply with the IHO the project will need to include an affordable one-bedroom unit, and an affordable two-bedroom unit. The project is conditioned as follows:

Healdsburg Avenue Apartments Affordable Housing Requirement				
	Units			
	1 Bedroom	2 Bedroom	3 Bedroom	Total
Very Low Income	1	1	0	2
Low Income	0	0	0	0
<b>Total</b>	1	1	0	2

State Density Bonus Law Concession/Incentive-in addition to the density bonus, the City is also required to provide “incentives” or “concessions” to each project which qualifies for a density bonus. A concession or incentive is defined as follows:

- A reduction in site development standards or a modification of zoning code or architectural design requirements, such as a reduction in setback or minimum square footage requirements; or
- Approval of mixed-use zone; or
- Other regulatory incentives or concessions which result in identifiable and actual cost reductions.

Based upon the number of affordable units proposed the applicant is entitled to one incentive or concession.

The applicant is requesting one concession/incentive consisting of a parking reduction from 55 spaces to 45 parking spaces. The Healdsburg Land Use Code requires on-site parking as follows:

1.5 parking spaces per unit x 30 units = 45 spaces

+ 1 guest space per each 3 units =10 spaces

= A total of 55 parking spaces are required to be provided on the project site.

The plans submitted include a total of 45 parking spaces proposed on the project site which is a parking reduction of 10 spaces. The rationale for the reduction is based the site’s location on Sonoma County Transit Route #67 (Healdsburg Shuttle). The site is located between two bus stops located on Healdsburg Avenue (500 feet away) and Front Street (300 feet away). The applicant also identifies the site’s location within a pedestrian/bicyclist friendly community and the site’s proximity to downtown Healdsburg as well as the proximity of on-street parking on Healdsburg Avenue and Front Street. It is the applicant’s position; the proposed parking is sufficient, and this proposed concession results in actual and identifiable cost reduction and allows for the maximum number of units which makes the project feasible.

In general, cities are compelled by the State Density Bonus Law to approve a requested incentive/concession, unless there is a specific adverse impact such as a fire, life, and safety issue, or a violation of state or federal law. It is staff’s position the concession requested is reasonable and would not have an adverse safety issue, and therefore, approval of the parking reduction is recommended.

State Density Bonus Law Waivers-In addition to the Density Bonus, and Concessions/Incentives, the applicant may also request a waiver(s). A concession/incentive is generally proposed to reduce the cost of constructing the project. A waiver(s) or reduction in standards may be proposed when the standard would physically preclude the project from being built at the permitted density and with the granted concession/incentive. In general, the City has more discretion when granting waivers, and must be convinced that the waivers requested are needed to achieve the density requested. The City is not

required to waive or reduce a standard that would cause a public health or safety problem, cause environmental harm, or harm an historical property. The applicant is requesting the following waivers:

1. Allow parking (4 spaces) within the 20-foot front yard setback which is not permitted per Land Use Code Section 20.08.055 and Section 20.16.170(D)(1). The proposed project includes four parking spaces at the project entrance located within the required 20-foot front setback. The two spaces closest to the street will be setback approximately 7 feet from the back of sidewalk and will be separated from the sidewalk by a landscaped planter.

Analysis – The project is located within a neighborhood that includes a mix of commercial, industrial and residential uses, as well as multiple zoning districts with varying front setback standards. In general, the parking lot is located at the rear and internal to the project site consistent with the Healdsburg City Wide Design Guidelines. The 7-foot-wide landscape planters proposed between the parking spaces and public sidewalk are adequate to help screen the parking lot from public view. Staff concurs that the waiver is needed for the proposed development to allow for an appropriate amount of parking for the project.

2. Allow 21 of the 46 parking spaces to be compact parking spaces 8 feet in width. Land Use Code Section 20.16.155 (A) does not permit the use of compact spaces and requires the use of 9-foot-wide standard stalls.

Analysis – Healdsburg is somewhat unusual in that the Land Use Code does not allow for the use of compact parking stalls. It is not uncommon for cities to allow up to 50% of the total number of parking spaces to be designated as compact which are spaces reduced in size in order to maximize the number of stalls. The length and width of the parking stalls is related to vehicle dimensions. The stall and aisle dimensions should be compatible with the type of operation planned for the facility. In recent years there have been changes in vehicle dimensions due to the popularity of sport utility vehicles and pickup trucks. For the near future a wide mix of vehicle sizes should be anticipated. The Healdsburg Land Use Code requires all spaces to be designed for large vehicles. The applicant is proposing that 45.6% of the parking spaces be designated as compact. Without the allowance for compact spaces the applicant would likely need to remove three parking stalls. It is staff's position that use of compact spaces is appropriate in that they allow for a range of vehicle sizes that would be expected within an apartment project and the three additional spaces are needed to provide adequate parking for the project.

### **Tenant Relocation Assistance:**

The Developer will need to provide relocation assistance to any qualifying household residing on the project site that will be displaced as a result of this project as required by the Healdsburg Municipal Code Chapter 9.44 (Tenant Relocation Assistance).

### **Growth Management Ordinance:**

The City of Healdsburg Growth Management Ordinance (GMO), established in November 2000, limits the number of building permits issued for market rate housing to 30 per year and not to exceed 90 units over a three-year cycle. An additional 150 middle-income units (price/rent restricted) are available over

a three-year cycle. The project will require 23 growth management allocations, as the 5 replacement units and the 2 affordable units do not require housing allocations. Allocations for the Healdsburg Avenue Apartments project are subject to availability. Even though a new 3-year cycle just started, there are a limited number of Category B allocations available as the Mill District and the Saggio Hills projects have reserved most of the allocations through the use of development agreements approved by the City Council.

Currently there are 10 allocations (Category B) available for the new 23 units subject to growth management. Depending on the applicant's construction schedule, the applicant may choose to construct the remaining 13 units as middle-income units (121% to 160% of the County median income) as these units would be classified as Category C allocations which are presently available.

### **Heritage Tree Permit:**

The applicant has submitted a Heritage Tree Permit application as required by Article II-Heritage Tree Protection of the Healdsburg Land Use Code. Generally, any tree that has a diameter of 30 inches or more requires the approval of a Heritage Tree Permit prior to removal with some exceptions. The applicant has submitted a tree inventory and preservation report prepared by a certified arborist. The tree assessment report for the proposed project, prepared by Horticultural Associates Consultants, dated April 8, 2021, determined that five heritage trees will be removed, including one camphor (#4), one bunya bunya (#18) two silver maples (#28 and #36), and one Monterey pine (#46). None of the heritage trees proposed for removal are native and the health of the five trees range from fair to good.

As stated in the arborist report trees are scattered throughout the site and most species are not native to the site and were planted as ornamentals and consist of privet, silk tree, crepe myrtle, Japanese maple, camphor, canary island palm, orange, redwood, silky oak, silver maple, bunya bunya, cypress, incense cedar, Monterey pine, English walnut and flowering cherry. Native species include coast live oak. The report identifies 46 trees that exist on the site or off-site trees that could be impacted by the development of the project. Twelve of the 46 trees meet the City's definition of a heritage tree, and five of 12 heritage trees are proposed for removal. Heritage trees proposed for removal include three trees (Monterey pine, silver maple and camphor) adjacent to Kennedy Lane and two trees (bunya bunya and silver maple) internal to the project site.

It is staff's position the criteria to grant approval of the Heritage Tree Permit has been met and the proposed removal is necessary to allow redevelopment of the property at a density established by the City's General Plan and as allowed by the state density bonus law. The project has been designed to preserve the large redwoods adjacent to the west property line and the project preserves the large oak trees along the south property line. The three existing palms will be preserved/relocated to maintain the existing character of Healdsburg Avenue.

### **Public Improvements:**

At the time this project application was submitted in 2017, a major issue for the project was the amount of frontage improvements that would be required by the City. The project site is challenging in that the property is a moderately sized corner lot without the benefit of existing frontage improvements. The site



is also located at relatively busy signalized intersection which is constrained due to the proximity of the Healdsburg Avenue Bridge. Developers often avoid these types of sites, due to the cost of constructing the frontage improvements on two streets and the loss of developable land due to the dedication of additional right-of-way to widen two streets to provide on-street parking, sidewalks, etc. If the intersection is required to be widened the developer is generally responsible for relocating/modifying the traffic signal(s).

At the time this application was submitted in 2017, the Healdsburg Public Works Director determined this project would not be required to modify the intersection and relocate the traffic signal(s) due to the fact the intersection improvements and signal had just been completed in 2016 as a part of the Healdsburg Avenue Bridge retrofit project, and it would not be appropriate to require a developer to relocate and reconstruct recently installed public improvements to develop a site already zoned for multi-family development. The Public Works Director also determined at the time the widening of Kennedy Lane to provide 7 on-street parking space was not appropriate as that land would be better used for housing.

Based upon the determinations made by the Public Works Director with the concurrence of the Community Development Department the project has been designed and conditioned to minimize frontage improvements. Proposed frontage improvements along Kennedy Lane include the addition of curb, gutter and a 5-foot-wide sidewalk adjacent to the curb along the project side of Kennedy Lane. A parking lane is not proposed on Kennedy Lane. In addition to increasing the amount of land available for housing, the elimination of the on-street parking lane, helps to maintain the existing rural character of the street. Improvements on Healdsburg Avenue include a curb, gutter, and the addition of a five-foot wide sidewalk behind a 7-foot-wide planter strip/parking bay (4 stalls). In general, improvements proposed on Healdsburg Avenue are consistent with existing improvements along the street. No modifications to the intersection configuration or traffic signals are proposed.

Undergrounding of existing overhead utilities: When the current General Plan was adopted in 2010 language was added to the General Plan to strengthen policies regarding the undergrounding of electrical, telephone, and cable TV services where feasible as new development occurs. The General Plan specifically requires that the ungrounding of utilities be included as a part City Entry Plans specifically the North Entry, the Dry Creek Road Entry, and the Central Healdsburg Entry. The General Plan also includes a policy to require the undergrounding of utilities as new development occurs.

The Healdsburg Municipal Code Chapter 13.24 requires the removal of existing poles, overhead wires and associated overhead structures when the City Council establishes an underground utility district by resolution. The project site is not located within a designated underground utility district. The project site is also not located in a City Entry as designated by the General Plan. In these situations, the requirement to underground existing utilities is determined on a case-by-case basis. The developer of the recently constructed River House Cottage Court project down the street proposed to underground the existing overhead utility lines along the project side of Kennedy, hence there has been a general community expectation that this project would also underground the existing overhead utility lines along the project side of Kennedy Lane and Healdsburg Avenue and remove the prominent power pole located at the southwest corner of the intersection.

The project site is located at a highly visible intersection on the west side of the Healdsburg Avenue Bridge. The west side of the bridge is generally viewed as the historical entrance into Healdsburg, and therefore, the Citywide Design Guidelines direct building and sites be designed to create a sense of entry at this location. The existing power poles and overhead utility lines along Kennedy Lane and Healdsburg Avenue and crossing over Healdsburg Avenue detract from the community character at this significant location.

City staff and the applicant have discussed the undergrounding issue to clarify if undergrounding of the existing utilities is being proposed by the applicant and/or if undergrounding is being required by the City. Due to the project's location at an intersection and with lines crossing Healdsburg Avenue, it was clear that to remove all the existing overhead lines and power poles along the frontage off-site work would be needed to remove the power pole at the corner and extend the lines under Healdsburg Avenue and connect to a new riser pole on Front Street. It has been staff's understanding that the applicant is willing to underground as much of the existing lines as financially feasible. To clarify the costs of undergrounding everything, staff requested that the applicant prepare a conceptual undergrounding plan with costs to help determine the scope of the undergrounding project. The applicant's submitted a undergrounding plan prepared by a utility design consultant documenting the work needed and estimated costs to underground all the existing overhead utility lines and remove the power pole at the intersection and a smaller power pole on Healdsburg Avenue. The underground plan also includes the work needed and costs for all the related off-site work needed to extend the power and communication lines under Healdsburg Avenue. It is staff's position that the undergrounding of the existing overhead utility lines and the removal of power poles is an important element of the project and that it is feasible for the project developer to complete all the on-site and off-site improvements needed to underground all the overhead utilities located along the Healdsburg Avenue and Kennedy Lane frontage. The undergrounding of all the existing overhead utilities is included as a condition of approval.

If during the construction design phase, the project developer documents that this condition is not feasible financially or otherwise, the project developer may request that the Planning Commission approve a reasonable alternative that is less costly.

## **APPLICABLE GENERAL PLAN AND LAND USE CODE INFORMATION**

### **General Plan**

The project site is within an area designated High Density Residential (HR) that includes the project site and the existing mobile home park to the south. The area along Healdsburg Avenue includes a mixture of residential, commercial and industrial land use designations. The High-Density Residential land use designation provides for single-family homes, multi-family units and mobile home parks within the density range of 10 to 20 units per acre. Density bonuses for affordable and senior housing may be granted consistent with state law and the City's housing incentive program. The proposed project is consistent with the High-Density Residential land use designation and furthers the following General Plan guiding principles, goals, and policies:

### **Guiding**

**Principle 2.C:** Promote a mix of housing types and affordable housing distributed throughout the community.

- Goal LU-A:** Orderly development within well-defined urban boundaries maintained by the City's adopted Urban Service Area/Urban Growth Boundary.
- Goal LU-C:** A pattern and intensity of land use that respects residential neighborhoods as well as natural constraints and conditions.
- Goal LU-G:** Maximized public use of the city's river frontage.
- Goal H-A:** Maximize opportunities for the development of a variety of housing types to accommodate anticipated growth, facilitate mobility within both the ownership and rental markets, and encourage a diverse community.
- Policy H-A-6:** Encourage the retention and development of rental units.
- Policy H-C-3:** Facilitate the development of housing affordable to lower-and moderate-income households, including first-time homebuyers.
- Policy H-C-5:** Continue to require the provision of low-and moderate-income housing within residential development projects subject to the Inclusionary Housing Program.
- Policy H-B-5:** Continue to reduce the required number of parking spaces and waive the requirement for covered parking for senior and affordable housing development, as feasible, if this will reduce development costs or improve the design of a project.
- Goal H-G:** To promote energy conservation in residential development and reduce greenhouse gas emissions.
- Goal CD-A:** Preservation and enhance of the most desirable qualities of Healdsburg's built environment.
- Policy CD-A-1:** The City will encourage building design of high quality that is in scale with adjacent development and that harmonizes with surrounding development.
- Policy CD-A-7:** The City will require the undergrounding of utilities as new development occurs to the extent that this does not adversely impact trees or cause similar undesirable consequences.
- Implementation Measure CD-5:** Require the undergrounding of utilities by new development where feasible while seeking to avoid adverse impacts on trees or similar undesirable consequences.
- Implementation Measure CD-14:** Develop a plan for undergrounding utilities in Healdsburg to enhance the aesthetic character of its downtown and other commercial areas, neighborhoods and entryways.

## **Land Use Code**

The Multi-Family Residential (RM) zoning district designation implements the High-Density Residential land use designation of the Healdsburg General Plan. The special purposes of the district include:

- A. Reserve appropriately located areas for family living in a variety of types of dwelling units at a reasonable range of population densities consistent with sound standards of public safety.
- B. Preserve as many as possible of the desirable characteristics of one-family residential districts while permitting higher population densities.
- C. Ensure that adequate light, air, privacy, and open space for each dwelling is provided.
- D. Provide space for public quasi-public facilities needed to complement urban residential areas and space for institutions that require a residential environment.
- E. Minimize traffic congestion and avoid the overloading of utilities by preventing the construction of buildings of excessive size in relation to the land around them.
- F. Provide necessary space for off-street parking of automobiles.
- G. Protect residential properties from the hazards, noise, and congestion caused by commercial and industrial traffic and land use activities.
- H. Protect residential properties from noise, illumination, unsightliness, odors, dust, dirt, smoke, vibration, heat, glare, and other objectionable influences.
- I. Protect residential properties from fire, explosion, noxious fumes and other hazards.

The proposed project is consistent with the special purposes of the RM zoning district listed above in that the project includes both affordable and market-rate units with a variety of unit sizes and the project site is near public opens space.

Based on the Schematic Design Set for 3 Healdsburg Avenue, the proposed development is consistent with the RM zoning district regarding site coverage, height, parking and access, landscaping and open space as noted in Table 1 below subject to concessions and waivers required by the State Density Bonus Law.

<b>Table 1</b>			
<b>Land Use Code Development Standards</b>			
<b>Standard</b>	<b>Required</b>	<b>Proposed</b>	<b>Conforms/Notes</b>
<b>Min Lot Size (square feet)</b>	6,000 sq. ft.	53,654 sq. ft.	Yes.
<b>Max Site Coverage</b>	40%	38.6%	Yes.
<b>Minimum Setbacks</b>			
Front Setback (Healdsburg Avenue)	20 feet	20 feet (building) 7 feet (parking)	Waiver requested as 4 parking spaces are located within the front setback
Side Setback	2-story 10 feet	10 feet	Yes.
Rear Setback	20 feet	20 feet	Yes.
<b>Max Height</b>	40 feet	30 feet	Yes.
<b>Landscaping</b>			
Max Fence Height	6 feet	6 feet	Yes.
Water Efficient Landscaping	Estimated Water Use (ETMU) is below Maximum Water Allowance (MAWA)	ETMU=149,825 gal/yr MAWA=183,634 gal/yr	Yes. Final Landscape Plan and Certification required at Building Permit.
<b>Parking</b>			
Parking Spaces	55	45 total (21 standard, 3 ADA, 21 compact) 32 of the 45 spaces are covered	Concession/waiver requested to allow compact stalls and parking reduction. The project includes covered bicycle parking.
<b>Open Space</b>			
<b>Minimum Usable OpenSpace (Common or Private)</b>	300 square feet of open space per unit x 30 units =9,000 sq. ft.	13,522 sq. ft.	Yes.

Riparian Setback: Article III – (Riparian Setbacks) of the Healdsburg Land Use Code regulates development adjacent to or near the Russian River, Foss Creek, and other streams. The minimum setback identified in the Land Use Code is 100 feet from the top of bank of the Russian River. The project is located approximately 40 feet from top of bank. The General Plan Land Use map identifies only the area east of the Kennedy Lane as Riparian Setback. In 2014, the Healdsburg Planning Director concluded that a conflict existed between the Land Use Code and the General Plan and determined that the General Plan would hold precedent and that a riparian setback variance would not be required for development on the west side of Kennedy Lane in that the west side of Kennedy Lane has no viable riparian habitat.

Parking and Access: As stated previously in this report the applicant is requesting concessions and/or waivers allowed by the State Density Bonus Law to reduce the number and size of parking stalls. The project includes adequate resident parking as required by the Land Use Code; however, the required 10 guest parking spaces are not provided. Generally, guests would need to park on the street adjacent to the site on Healdsburg Avenue (4 spaces) or along Front Street north of the project site. No on-street parking is existing or proposed on Kennedy Lane. A total of 30 covered spaces are required and the project includes 32 carport spaces. Access to the project is via a single driveway from Healdsburg Avenue located on the west side of the property. An emergency vehicle access is proposed from the parking lot out to Kennedy Lane.

Landscaping: The proposed landscaping and associated areas have been evaluated for conformance with the City's Water Efficient Landscape Ordinance (WELo) and the preliminary calculations comply with the WELo requirements. A final landscape plan and certification are required at building permit.

Stormwater: The project will be required to install post construction stormwater treatment best management practices (BMP) in accordance with the current version of the Low Impact Development (LID) Technical Design Manual. A Final Stormwater Management Plan will be required to be submitted with the building permit plans for the site.

Open Space: The project proposes to meet the required open space for each residential unit through the provision of private open space in the form of ground level and second story porches, The code requires a minimum of 300 square feet of common/private open space per residential unit and the project provides between 450 square feet of common/private open space per unit.

Trash Disposal/Collection: The site includes a trash enclosure located at the southwest corner of the parking lot.

### **Consistency with the Citywide Design Guidelines**

The following discussion and analysis evaluate the consistency of the proposed project against the applicable sections of the Citywide Design Guidelines. The subject site is located within Character Area 6 – Healdsburg Corridor. In addition, Chapter 6 applies to the proposed project. Those sections which are not applicable to the proposed project have not been included in the discussion below. The following discussion provides a narrative and staff findings for Chapters 4 and 6.

- **Chapter 4: Character Area 6: Healdsburg Corridor**

Building Placement: Buildings should be placed relatively close to the back of the sidewalk in order to extend the character and feel of Downtown northward and to the southern entrance. Some variation in placement of front walls is appropriate but buildings should fall within a narrow range that creates a street wall along Healdsburg Avenue.

*The RM zoning district requires a 20-foot setback which precludes the placement of the building at the back of the sidewalk. The building is set as close as possible at 20 feet.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

Orientation: Buildings should be oriented toward Healdsburg Avenue. Orientation toward a side street may be appropriate provided that the Healdsburg Avenue frontage is prioritized. Secondary orientation toward an internal parking area, plaza or internal courtyard area is also appropriate.

*The residential units facing Healdsburg Avenue and Kennedy Lane include a direct walkway connection from the unit to street*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

Connections: Pathways should directly connect a pedestrian from Healdsburg Avenue to buildings along the street where a building does not open directly onto the sidewalk. Pathways should also be provided to the interior of a site on a deeper lot, in-between buildings.

*The required 20-foot setback precludes the location of the building directly at the sidewalk. The project includes multiple pathways that provide direct connections from apartments to Healdsburg Avenue and Kennedy Lane. The EVA also provides pedestrian access from the project to Kennedy Lane.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

Vehicular Access: Minimize vehicular access points from Healdsburg Avenue to the extent feasible. Provide consolidated access from side streets wherever possible to maintain a strong street wall along Healdsburg Avenue and to minimize conflicts with pedestrians.

*The proposed project is served by a single driveway access on Healdsburg Avenue at a location as far from the intersection as possible.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

### Key Building Design Elements in Character Area 6: Healdsburg Corridor

Entries: Functional entries should be designed to face Healdsburg Avenue. Additional entries may face an interior parking area, paseo or a side street, but not in lieu of providing entries along Healdsburg Avenue. Refer to design guidelines 6.47-6.50.

*The project has been modified so the front of each unit adjacent to the street will face either Healdsburg Avenue or Kennedy Lane. While most of the main entries (front doors) are located at the front of the unit they are side-facing on to the porch/entry area, and therefore are not highly visible from the street. The project includes clearly identifiable patio/porch entries that stand out visually and provide an alternate means of achieving the guidelines.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

Building Footprints: Larger building footprints are appropriate in this area given the significant redevelopment potential and deep lots. However, it is recommended that single building lengths

parallel to Healdsburg Avenue not exceed 250 feet, in keeping with a typical block size in Downtown. Refer to design guidelines 6.41 and 6.42.

*The proposed project includes two buildings with frontage on Healdsburg Avenue. The buildings front's length are 80 feet and 37 feet, and therefore do not exceed the 250 foot guideline.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

Building Articulation: Articulation of buildings in this area should be prioritized. A long building wall (greater than 50' wide) should use articulation methods to reduce the perceived mass of a building as viewed from the public realm. Since the community vision for Character Area 6 and 7 is an extension of Downtown's character, articulation methods should break the building down into smaller, human-scaled modules that maintain the character of the narrow, highly-articulated buildings seen in Downtown. Refer to design guidelines 6.43-6.45 and Figures 6.20 and 6.21.

*As noted above the proposed building does not have a long building wall as viewed from the public realm. Nevertheless, the proposed building's front façade provides articulation using 2-foot building offsets, varying roof heights and forms, and shed roofs over doors and windows resulting in a high level of articulation.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

Roof Form: Promote flexibility in the design of a roof in Character Area 6. This will provide a subtle distinction from Downtown and respond to the existence of pitched residential roof forms seen in the area today. Other contemporary roof forms, like shed roofs and butterfly roofs, are also appropriate. Refer to design guidelines 6.55 – 6.57.

*The proposed shed roofs and gable roofs are consistent with the design of the proposed buildings which includes a combination of traditional and contemporary elements and provide further building articulation and visual interest to the project.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

- **Chapter 6: Design Guidelines for Commercial, Industrial, Mixed Use and Large-Scale Multi-Family Development**

SITE DESIGN: Site design refers to the arrangement, placement and orientation of buildings and site features on a parcel.

Building Placement and Setback Character: Buildings should be placed to establish a street wall in the contexts and Character Areas where a street wall is an important feature. In other Character Areas, building placement may be more varied. Front setback areas should be designed as visual and sometimes functional amenities. Preferred placement and setback character may differ based on the Character Area or the context established on a particular street.

*The RM zoning district requires a 20-foot setback which precludes the placement of the front the apartment buildings at the back of the sidewalk. The buildings are set as close as possible at 20 feet.*



***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

Building Orientation: Building orientation refers to how building walls relate to their surroundings. A building should be sited to establish a strong visual connection to the public realm. A building's primary entrance should face the street in order to create an engaging and pedestrian-friendly streetscape.

*The proposed apartment buildings are oriented toward Healdsburg Avenue and Kennedy Lane as well as the internal parking area. Multiple pathways are provided between the street and the apartment entrances and patios. A landscaped entry court is proposed at the intersection of Healdsburg Avenue and Kennedy Lane to enhance the appearance of the intersection.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

External Pedestrian Connectivity: Clearly marked pedestrian access should be provided between the public realm, a site and a building. A strong physical and visual relationship between these elements enhances walkability.

*The project includes clearly defined pedestrian access pathways from the sidewalk to the apartment entrances and patios.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with overall intent of the Design Guidelines.***

Internal Pedestrian Connectivity: An internal pedestrian circulation system should connect site elements internal to a project.

*The project includes an extensive internal pathway system connecting all the apartments with the common open space, parking and the trash enclosure.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

Vehicular Connectivity: Vehicular connections should provide safe and comfortable balance between vehicles, bicycles and pedestrians and to reduce conflicts. Design considerations vary by Character Area, as described in Chapter 4.

*The residential units are accessed via a single shared driveway from Healdsburg Avenue and is located as far as possible from the signalized intersection which limits the potential for vehicular conflicts.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

Outdoor Places: Outdoor places include plazas, courtyards, patios, small park spaces and landscaped features. Outdoor places should be designed to create a vibrant image and invite pedestrian activity by incorporating durable furnishings and amenities such as public art. Where possible, development should celebrate Healdsburg's natural features (such as the Russian River and Foss Creek) by integrating them with new development and create new outdoor places where appropriate.

*The project site is rather unusual in that it located near City and County parks as well as the Russian River. The area has a semi-rural feel with scenic qualities. The project will enhance the pedestrian experience by the addition of sidewalks along Healdsburg Avenue and Kennedy Lane and a small, landscaped courtyard at the intersection.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guidelines.***

**Parking Design:** Site design considerations for parking include the location of surface lots and parking structures, the access points to parking facilities and the relationship of parking to pedestrian and vehicular circulation systems. A parking facility should be visually unobtrusive to the public realm and should be designed to minimize vehicular-pedestrian conflicts. A surface parking lot should include landscaping and pedestrian pathways. Minimize the visual impact of surface parking. Located a surface parking lot the interior of site, away from the public realm and behind a primary structure. In multi-family development, minimize the visibility of common parking areas from the public realm. Screen surface parking from public view using one or more of the following: landscaping, site walls, fencing, public art, or a combination of these features.

*The project locates the parking at the rear of the project and generally internal to the project. A portion of the parking lot is located adjacent to Healdsburg Avenue at the project entrance. As stated previously in this report the applicant has requested a density bonus waiver to allow 4 parking spaces within the required 20-foot setback. The visual impact of the parking will be minimized by the use of trees and shrubs within 7-foot-wide planters located behind the public sidewalk.*

*The project will be required to install post construction stormwater treatment best management practices (BMP) in accordance with the current version of the Low Impact Development (LID) Technical Design Manual. A Final Stormwater Management Plan will be required to be submitted with the building permit plans for the site.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

**Landscape Design:** Landscaping addresses the basic aesthetics of a site including trees, shrubs and other plantings as well as ornamental features and topography. Landscaping can enhance a project by providing visual interest, tying together key site features, providing shade, softening harder building elements, screening unattractive site features from public view and providing buffers between properties. Landscape designs should preserve mature trees and highlight distinctive topographic or other site features and create a sense of visual continuity within a site and between properties. Landscaping should be provided for a site, even when there is limited space.

*A major feature of this portion of Healdsburg Avenue are the mature palms that line both sides of the street and create a sense of arrival as you enter the city from the east. The project site includes three existing palms. Two of the palms are highly visible from Healdsburg Avenue and the third palm is visible from Kennedy Lane. One palm adjacent to Healdsburg Avenue will be preserved as a part of the project and palm will be relocated to a location adjacent to Healdsburg Avenue. The numerous oak trees along the southern property line adjacent to the mobile home park will also be preserved.*

*Formal landscaping is proposed within the front setback area along Healdsburg Avenue and Kennedy Lane and throughout the project (See Sheets L1-0 to L1-4 of the plan set). Planting pallet includes tree and shrub species designed to enhance the appearance of the project as viewed from Healdsburg Avenue and Kennedy Lane and provide shade.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

**Fences, Walls and Landscape Buffers:** Fences, free-standing walls and landscape buffers are often used to enclose a private outdoor place. Retaining walls are used to address site topography. Cut and fill on a site should be minimized whenever possible, and development should work with the topography. These site features should be carefully coordinated with the overall site design of a

property. Visible fence and wall materials should be compatible with materials used throughout a site and on a building. Fences, walls or decorative buffers are especially important when a development is adjacent to a residential property in order to minimize impacts. The guidelines that follow are most critical for areas of a site that are visible from the public realm and along a front property line.

*The applicant is proposing to install open wire fencing around the private ground level patios to maintain a more open feel and six-foot high solid wood fencing is proposed along the property boundaries to the south and west to minimize impacts between the adjacent uses.*

**Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.**

Lighting: Site lighting includes streetlights, light fixtures in parking lots, pedestrian lighting and lighting to accent landscaping or building façades. Site lighting should help establish a sense of identity and sense of continuity for the property. Site lighting should create a sense of place and highlight distinctive architectural details. Lighting should be designed to coordinate with and enhance a project's design.

*The project incorporates building lighting including LED Sconce lights to illuminate the doorways, pathways and the parking area.*

**Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.**

Service Areas and Utilities: Service areas and utilities include loading docks, trash areas, electrical stations and other necessary functions. These should be designed to be visually unobtrusive and to be integrated with the site and building. The visual impact of a service area on the public right-of-way should be minimized. More information regarding the location and design of public utilities, such as transformers, can be found in Chapter 9.

*The site includes a trash enclosure located at the southwest corner of the parking lot and generally will not be visible from the street. The enclosure includes siding and roof material to match that of the apartment buildings.*

**Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.**

BUILDING DESIGN: The overall size, height and form of a building determine how large it appears, and whether it is compatible with existing development within a given context.

Building Mass and Scale: The overall size, height and form of a building determine how large it appears, and whether it is compatible with existing development within a given context. A larger building can incorporate design features to ensure it is not monolithic in scale and that its perceived mass is reduced. Where compatibility is important, a building should be designed to reflect patterns of building mass and scale and articulate a façade to create a pedestrian-friendly environment.

Façade Design: Visible building façades that incorporate high-quality design features enhance Healdsburg's image and character, and convey an active and vibrant appearance to pedestrians, bicyclists and vehicles passing through the city. The design guidelines presented below apply to visible façades that face public streets, sidewalks, pedestrian areas and parking lots. These design guidelines are particularly important for new development in Character Area 5: Downtown Core and 6: Healdsburg Corridor. A façade should be designed into separate components that convey a human scale and create a consistent rhythm within the façade.

*The five proposed buildings are both modest in size and consistent with the patterns of mass and scale along this section of Healdsburg Avenue. The proposed buildings incorporate variations in materials, building insets, and variation in roof types and heights to reduce the overall scale of the project. Each building includes four-sided architecture consisting of board and batten siding, horizontal lap siding, and a combination of gabled and shed roofs with composition shingles. All windows and doors include trim.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

Street Level Interest: A building's ground floor strongly impacts the pedestrian experience on an adjacent public space, such as a sidewalk or public plaza. Blank or featureless walls at the ground floor level can diminish interest and reduce the quality of the pedestrian experience. A building should be designed to promote pedestrian interest at the street-level. Avoid long, blank walls on the ground floor level. Transparent ground floors that support a visual connection between the public realm and interior commercial building space is the most effective way to generate street level interest. This treatment is strongly encouraged and particularly for areas where a commercial use is located directly adjacent to a sidewalk, street, plaza or other public realm element. However, active storefronts and fully transparent windows may not be feasible on all street-facing building walls. Where this occurs, consider the use of one or more of the street level interest methods.

*The proposed apartment project provides street-level interest with the prominent porches and large windows facing the street which provide a balance between the public and private realm. Landscaping within the required 20-foot front setback includes trees and shrubs that add further visual interest at the street level.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

Building Entry: Building entrances provide a key visual and physical connection between the public and private realm. A door should be easily recognizable and distinguishable from the rest of the building. Where compatibility with context is important, building entries should be spaced to provide visual continuity and compatibility within traditional buildings in a Character Area.

*The project has been modified so the front of each unit adjacent to the street will face either Healdsburg Avenue or Kennedy Lane. While most of the main entries (front doors) are located at the front of the unit they are side-facing on to the porch/entry area, and therefore are not highly visible from the street. The project includes clearly identifiable patio/porch entries that stand out visually and provide an alternate means of achieving the guidelines.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

Windows: Windows are a key design element. New development should incorporate windows of a design and arrangement that expresses a human scale, create visual interest and in some cases creates visual continuity with context.

*The proposed buildings include large, primarily vertically-oriented, recessed windows that create depth and shadow on each façade. Some deviations in the orientation and size of the windows serve to add additional visual interest. The windows are consistently spaced, appropriately sized, and correspond to the interior spaces. The windows are compatible with the traditional and contemporary design elements of the building.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

**Roof Form:** Roof form addresses the visible characteristics of a building’s roof, which contribute to the character of a building. Where compatibility with context is important, roof forms that convey compatible mass and scale.

*The design guidelines for Character Area 6 promote flexibility in roof design including contemporary roof forms such as the proposed shed roof. The buildings include both shed and gable roof design giving the building traditional as well as a more contemporary appearance.*

**Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.**

**Building Materials and Color:** Exterior building materials provide a sense of scale and texture that convey design quality and visual interest. Building façades, especially at the street-level, should use high-quality, durable materials that convey high quality in design and detail. Typical materials vary throughout Healdsburg’s Character Areas.

*The five apartment buildings incorporate a range of materials (board and batten and lap siding), which provide distinct components to the building’s façade. The main roof is composition shingle and the carports include a corrugated metal roof. The proposed materials and color palette are compatible with building materials and colors typically seen in Healdsburg. See the materials/colors sheet in the plan set.*

**Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.**

**Renovation of Existing Structures:** The renovation and reuse of an existing structure is encouraged. Renovating existing structures also reduces waste from demolition and reduces the number of new materials used in a project, compared to a new construction.

*The project proposes to demolish the five existing residential units. In general, it is not possible to preserve and reuse the existing structures and develop the site with higher density housing as called for by the General Plan.*

**Staff Finding: Consistent with overall intent of the Design Guidelines.**

**Sensitive Transitions:** Sensitive transitions address the relationship between buildings of higher densities or of more public uses that are adjacent to lower-scale residential neighborhoods. Site design adjacent to an existing or future residential neighborhood should provide a compatible transition that minimizes potential negative impacts.

*The proposed 100 % residential project complies with the required 20-foot setback from the adjacent mobile home park. The existing building setbacks at the adjacent mobile home park range from only 1 foot to 10 feet.*

**Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guidelines.**

- **Chapter 7: Design Guidelines for all Development Types**

**Heritage Tree Preservation:** Healdsburg heritage trees should be protected and should be incorporated into the design of the development wherever possible.

*The project includes the preservation of native coast live oak and the preservation and/or relocation of three existing date palms that contribute to the existing character of Healdsburg Avenue. A total of 46 trees were evaluated in the tree inventory and preservation report prepared by Horticultural Associates. A total of 18 trees will be preserved/relocated with the development of the project.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

Sustainability: Development in Healdsburg should incorporate sustainable design features whenever possible to reduce environmental impacts and conserve energy.

*The project includes exterior shading devices consisting of window overhangs to manage solar gain in the summer and allow for solar access in the winter months. Compact parking spaces are provided which help encourage the use of fuel-efficient vehicles. The architectural plans include solar panels on the carport roof areas to provide solar-oriented energy generating technologies. CALgreen requires that EV capable parking spaces be equipped with conduit and electrical panel capacity to support future installation of wiring and electric vehicle supply equipment.*

***Staff Finding: Consistent with the Design Guideline.***

**FINDINGS:**

Pursuant to Land Use Code section 20.28.125, the Planning Commission is required to make the following findings to approve a Major Design Review Permit; staff has provided suggested findings below.

- A. The proposed development or use is consistent with all applicable policies and requirements of the General Plan and Land Use Code.

*The proposed use is within the range of uses contemplated in the High Density Residential (HR) General Plan land use designation. The proposed multi-family residential use is consistent with the anticipated uses identified in the General Plan. The project meets or exceeds all development requirements in the Land Use Code, including building height, lot coverage, setbacks, landscaping, and on-site parking and loading except with concessions and waivers permitted by the State Density Bonus Law.*

- B. The proposed design of the development or use, and all appurtenant structures, is consistent with the policies set forth in the Citywide Design Guidelines, as may be amended from time to time.

*The proposed project has been found to be consistent with the Citywide Design Guidelines in Chapters 4, 6, and 7. The proposed project is consistent with the scale and character of residential commercial and industrial uses found along this stretch of Healdsburg Avenue. The proposed colors and materials are compatible with the surrounding area and respect the character of the City. The front setback and the building's mass, articulation, and scale are consistent and compatible with development in the area. Therefore, the design of the proposed project is consistent with the Citywide Design Guideline's policies to promote quality, attractive design.*

- C. The proposed development or use is consistent with the purposes of the zoning district in which it is located.

*The RM zoning district designation implements the High-Density Residential (HR) land use designation of the Healdsburg General Plan. The special purposes of the district provide for well-planned multi-family housing. The multi-family project is a permitted use in the RM zoning district.*

- D. The proposed development or use is consistent with all other conditions imposed by the Planning Commission or City Council with respect to any matter related to the purpose of design review.

*The property does not have any conditions that were previously placed on the site. As part of the subject project, conditions of approval have been included in the resolution that will be required to be complied with throughout the life of the project. The proposed project is subject to the Land Use Code, including allowed uses and development standards, and the Citywide Design Guidelines. As noted above, the proposed project has been found to be consistent with the Land Use Code and Citywide Design Guidelines and as such the proposed project is consistent with any conditions imposed by the Planning Commission or City Council.*

### **PLANNING COMMISSION CONSIDERATIONS/ALTERNATIVES:**

As discussed in this report the major issues for this project include a 10-space on-site parking reduction and minimizing public frontage improvements by not requiring on-street parking (7 spaces) on Kennedy Lane. Generally, the lack of available parking is the most significant challenge facing higher density housing developments. Parking, especially residential parking, is an amenity that has often been seen as a necessity in the U.S.; however, in recent years there has been considerable debate regarding the potential broader social, economic and environmental impacts of providing parking, and how it affects our land use and transportation systems. Generally, the trend in larger Cities has been to require less parking to encourage people to make sustainable transportation choices. The built environment can make operating and owning a vehicle convenient or troublesome, needed or unnecessary. Historically, off-street parking requirements have resulted in too much parking availability which induces sprawl, vehicle dependency, and higher costs of housing construction. Studies have broadly found that the availability of off-street parking alone encourages higher rates of vehicle ownership and driving. Studies have also shown that even when accounting for access to high quality transit, off-street parking will encourage people to own cars.

The easiest ways for developers to increase densities as allowed by the State Density Bonus law are through increased building height and/or an on-site parking reduction. The project applicant has chosen not to request an increase in building height. The project is proposing 1.5 on-site parking spaces per unit. It is likely the amount of parking provided will not always meet the varied needs of the residents and non-residents. As neighborhoods transition to higher density housing through the development of apartments such as this project and the addition of accessory dwelling units within existing single-family neighborhoods the City and the County will need to continue their efforts to encourage the use of alternative modes of transportation.

It is Staff's position that the project as proposed achieves an appropriate balance in that the project scale and architectural design are compatible with the neighborhood and the City, the project provides needed housing, and the project's location is in close proximity to existing and future alternative transportation options help to offset the reduction in number of parking spaces.

After public comment and deliberation, the Planning Commission may consider alternatives to address concerns provided from the public. This may include approving the project as conditioned or as modified by the Planning Commission or continuing the project to a later date to address design-related concerns.

## ENVIRONMENTAL ANALYSIS:

The project has been determined to be exempt from environmental review pursuant to the provisions of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15303 (Class 32), In-Fill Development Projects in that the proposed buildings and associated site improvements meet the following conditions contained in Class 32 In-fill Exemptions as follows:

- (a) The project is consistent with the applicable general plan designation and all applicable general plan policies as well as the applicable zoning designation and regulations.

*The proposed project is located on a site within the High Density (HR) General Plan Land Use designation and the Multi Family (RM) Zoning District. The proposed apartment project is a permitted use and the proposed buildings and site improvements are consistent with the development standards of the zoning district and are consistent with the development standards of the zoning district and general development standards set forth in the Land Use Code except as modified by Density Bonus Law concessions and/or waivers. The courts have determined modifications required by the Density Bonus Law do not disqualify the project from claiming the exemption.*

- (b) The proposed development occurs within the city limits on a project site of no more than five acres substantially surrounded by urban uses.

*The subject site is 1.232 acres, located within the city limits of the City of Healdsburg, and is adjacent to urban uses on three sides.*

- (c) The project site has no value as habitat for endangered, rare or threatened species.

*The project site is a relatively small lot with five existing detached homes and landscaping and provides no value as habitat for endangered, rare, or threatened species. The project site is across Kennedy Lane from the Russian River; however, all existing and proposed improvements and construction activities are located outside of designated General Plan riparian setbacks.*

- (d) Approval of the project would not result in any significant effects relating to traffic, noise, air quality, or water quality.

- **Traffic:** *The project site is located at the intersection of Healdsburg Avenue and Kennedy Lane/Front Street. This intersection is fully signalized and is a major entrance and exit point between Healdsburg and points south. Due to proximity of the intersection to the Healdsburg Bridge, the design of the intersection is very tight and changes to this configuration are not possible. At the time this project was submitted in 2017, the Public Works Director determined that a traffic study was not needed in that the project was already zoned for multifamily development and is designed with a single driveway placed as far away from the intersection as possible, and therefore traffic impacts are minimized to the maximum extent feasible.*
- **Noise:** *The project site is located within an existing urbanized area with a mixture of commercial and residential uses. The proposed residential project is not a use that would*



warrant a noise study with respect to noise generation. Based on the 2030 General Plan Safety Element, the area is located within a projected future noise contour area of less than 60 dBA. The General Plan allows up to 65 dBA for multi-family residential uses and conditionally allows up to 70 dBA. Interior residential may not exceed 45 Dba. Additionally, the proposed project does not include sensitive receptors and is not located within proximity of any sensitive receptors. Noise generated on the project site would be subject to the requirements of the Healdsburg Municipal Code (Section 9.32).

- **Air Quality:** The project site is in the North Coast Air Basin, where air quality is regulated by the North Sonoma County Air Pollution Control District (NSAPCD). The Air Basin is in attainment for all federal and State ambient air quality standards. Therefore, the project is not required to conduct any additional analysis. Due to the small construction footprint and short construction timeframe, the applicant will not be required to prepare or implement an air quality plan. In addition, the Healdsburg 2030 General Plan includes policy NR-28, includes Best Management Practices (BMPs) to address construction related air emissions and have been included in the conditions of approval for the project.
- **Water Quality:** The project will be required to install post construction stormwater treatment best management practices (BMP) in accordance with the current version of the Low Impact Development (LID) Technical Design Manual. A Final Stormwater Management Plan will be required to be submitted with the building permit plans for the site.

(e) The site can be adequately served by all required utilities and public services.

*The site is located within the City of Healdsburg urban service area and can be adequately served by the City's water and sewer systems. Electric is provided by the City of Healdsburg Utilities. Natural gas is provided to the site by Pacific Gas and Electric. The City of Healdsburg provides Fire and Police services for the site.*

#### **FISCAL INFORMATION:**

The project is a privately funded development project. New development is required to pay development impacts fees and fund on-site improvements.

#### **DEPARTMENT COMMENTS:**

The project development plans were routed to all City Departments for review and comments received have been incorporated into the proposed conditions of approval.

#### **ATTACHMENTS:**

1. Draft Planning Commission Resolution No. 2022-01
2. Proposed Plan (date stamped August 8, 2022)
3. Aerial Exhibit
4. Zoning and Vicinity Map
5. Arborist Report
6. Undergrounding plan and costs